

TOWARD DATING CONSTRUCTION OF THE ABBEY CHURCH OF PONTIGNY

By TERRYL N. KINDER

Lack of precise dates for construction of the first great church at Pontigny Abbey has prevented scholars from assessing the proper role of this major Burgundian edifice in the evolution of early Gothic architecture. Dates have most frequently been estimated by comparing one aspect of the style, construction technique or building materials at Pontigny to those of other (often equally tenuously dated) regional buildings.

In this paper, style has been set aside in an effort to circumvent the circular reasoning that has prevented a clear assessment of the problem. Instead, the building has been dated contextually via documentary evidence for patronage, the role and interest of the abbot, pattern and numbers of vocations and other purely historic elements. The synthesis of these facts points to the late 1130s for the beginning of construction, under the abbacy of Guichard and the patronage of Count Thibaut the Great of Champagne. With abundant means and manpower, work appears to have been completed around or shortly after 1150.

THE ABBEY OF PONTIGNY lies on the border between Champagne and Burgundy, in the broad valley of the Serein river near the hillside vineyards of Chablis (Pl. V). The second of Cîteaux's four elder daughters and one of the five governing abbeys of the Order,¹ Pontigny has long been recognised for its ecclesiastical, political and historical prominence. Ten of Pontigny's abbots were elevated to the rank of bishop, archbishop, or cardinal; three archbishops of Canterbury — Thomas Becket, Stephen Langton, and Edmund of Abingdon — were granted sanctuary here; and when Saint Edmund died nearby, he was buried in the abbey church, where his tomb is still an object of pilgrimage.

Of the five mother-houses, Pontigny is the only one whose medieval church has survived. It is, in fact, the largest remaining Cistercian oratory in France and has been the object of many studies. Yet with its precociously rib-vaulted nave, early use of flying buttresses and expansively rebuilt choir, Pontigny stands apart from the vision of rectilinear tranquillity which usually comes to mind when Cistercian churches are mentioned.

The small chapel built when the abbey was founded² was superseded by a monumental building which included the transepts, nave, aisles, and porch of the present edifice. At the end of the twelfth century the original flat-ended chevet was replaced by the early Gothic sanctuary with ambulatory and corona of radiating chapels seen today.³ Yet lack of a secure date for the first major rebuilding has prevented a fuller appreciation of its design, within the development both of early Cistercian architecture and that of Burgundy. This issue is the focus of the present article.

Of the other four governing houses, only the lay brothers' building at Clairvaux remains as witness to the architecture of the twelfth century. The best example in Burgundy — and one of the most complete surviving Cistercian complexes — is Fontenay (Côte-d'Or), second daughter of Clairvaux, much of which was apparently built between 1139 and 1147. It is here that we see the importance of establishing reliable dates for the construction of Pontigny: while the churches of Pontigny and Fontenay are very different

JBA, CXLV (1992), 77–88, Pl V

in scale, vaulting system, architectural design, use of light, and general effect, they nevertheless share a common plan, sense of restraint, and almost identical proportional system. This raises interesting questions with regard to the origins of Cistercian design and its interpretation at individual sites, and underlines the disturbing lack of a more precise date for construction at Pontigny.⁴

The date most generally accepted for construction of the church is *c.* 1150, and this suggestion first appears in the seventeenth-century histories of Pontigny by Dom Georges Viole (1598–1669) and Dom Edme Robinet.⁵ Subsequent historians seem to have accepted this date without further discussion,⁶ and architects and antiquaries of the nineteenth century simply attempted to refine it from their own observations of architectural detail. Etienne Chaillou des Barres, for example, accepted the date 'vers 1150' for the beginning of construction, although he noted '... dans le caractère de l'édifice des signes qui indiquent déjà les approches de la fin du douzième siècle', and thus concluded that work was not completed immediately. The *signes* to which he was referring were in the rebuilt choir, for at the time he was writing its reconstruction in the late twelfth century had not yet been identified, and it was considered to be part of the original structure.⁷ In a similar way, Emile Amé, General Inspector for the *Monuments historiques* in the Yonne, dated the nave and transepts from 1150 to the end of the twelfth century by capital styles.⁸ Viollet-le-Duc, who also believed the later Gothic choir to have been part of the original structure, therefore dated the church 'vers la fin du XII^e siècle';⁹ and Georg Dehio simply followed the *Gallia christiana* in dating the beginning of construction of a new church and cloister buildings at Pontigny to 1150.¹⁰

The same date reappears in the writings of twentieth-century historians,¹¹ and architects and art historians, while positing various dates based on their own interpretations of style and building materials, still appear to be hidebound by '*c.* 1150'. André Philippe, for example, an architect whose 1907 plan of Pontigny is the most accurate one published to date, placed construction of the original choir and transepts between 1150–60, followed by the nave and façade from 1160–80. He also proposed that the north side of the nave was built after the south side in order to explain the presence of flying buttresses along the north flank only.¹² Sigurd Curman, while making numerous perspicacious insights from his own reading of the building, clung to the date of *c.* 1150 for the beginning of work, with a terminus of 1180 on stylistic grounds.¹³ Hans Rose, likewise, hypothesised that construction began around 1150, but that the choir and west façade were rebuilt *c.* 1180 because of the pointed arcade applied to the façade above the round-arched openings.¹⁴ Ernst Gall believed that construction began in 1160 simultaneously in the nave, aisles, and transepts, the transepts being completed by 1170, nave and aisles by 1180.¹⁵ Georges Fontaine, whose 1928 monograph on Pontigny remains the modern reference work for the building, believed construction began at the east end in 1150.¹⁶ His argument is based on a comparison of materials. He noted that the transept walls at Pontigny and also the façade at Fontenay were both made of coursed rubble with ashlar quoins, and suggested that since Fontenay was nearing completion toward the middle of the twelfth century, Pontigny must have been started at about that time. The façade of Pontigny, however, he dated fifty years later because of its ashlar surface.¹⁷

Other authors have assigned dates with less explanation: Marcel Aubert, for example, wrote that construction of the church began between 1140 and 1160 at the east end, that

the nave vaults were built, and arguments in support of this. Dimier suggested 1140 for the choir. Hanno Hahn likewise suggested 1140 but again without discussion. He started at the eastern end of the transepts; both of these parts of the church were completed soon after. Prache, on the other hand, dated the nave, and felt they were the result of the construction of the nave. French Gothic architecture began in 1145 on, but apparently not only discuss the choir.

Such is the state of the theories which are based on the most satisfactory way of dating the era. My own approach is to concentrate on instances of the abbey architecture of the Great of Champagne, and its style, but by its own nature frequently occurs when details of one building are compared with another.

Pontigny was founded by Hugh of Mâcon, had been the son of Hugh's devout and capable father. New vocations entered the abbey during his abbacy of 1136–65, and appear to have been concentrated in quarters at the abbey. A modest stone chapel was built at this time.²⁷

When Hugh left Pontigny to Guichard, a monk of Fontenay (1136–65), the number of daughter abbeys were at least fifty priests at Pontigny, of course, lay brothers were also known. And if they were not, they had been under very careful supervision.

The pattern of daughter abbeys differed somewhat from Pontigny's filiation in that the foundations in 1124

the nave vaults were built 1160–70, and the façade and porch by 1170, but gives no arguments in support of his dates.¹⁸ In his encyclopedic collection of plans, Fr Anselme Dimier suggested 1140–60 for the beginning of work and 1170 for the completion.¹⁹ Hanno Hahn likewise dated construction between 1140–70, perhaps following Aubert, but again without discussion or sources.²⁰ Robert Branner suggested that work had started at the eastern end c. 1145 despite the absence of dossierets and formerets in the transepts; both of these elements, he thought, appeared around 1150 in the nave, which was completed soon after 1155 with the first ribbed vault in the Yonne valley.²¹ Anne Prache, on the other hand, did not believe that ribbed vaults were originally intended in the nave, and felt they could not be dated before 1160–70.²² Jean Bony likewise dated construction of the nave to c. 1160, but without discussion.²³ In a recent overview of French Gothic architecture, Dieter Kimpel and Robert Suckale cite R. Branner's date of 1145 on, but apparently did not consider the nave of Pontigny as Gothic at all, since they only discuss the choir.²⁴

Such is the state of the question with regard to the dating of Pontigny. We have a variety of theories which are based mostly on different individual elements, and this is hardly the most satisfactory way of situating a major edifice standing at the dawn of a new stylistic era. My own approach in this brief study will be significantly different. Instead of concentrating on individual elements of style, I shall examine the economic circumstances of the abbey and its early history, together with its alleged ties to Count Thibaut the Great of Champagne, and thereby attempt to date the construction of Pontigny not by its style, but by its own past. In this way, we may avoid that circular dating which all too frequently occurs when a study is based on a comparison of structural or decorative details of one building with other buildings which are presumed to be contemporary.

Pontigny was founded in 1114 as the second daughter of Cîteaux. The first abbot, Hugh of Mâcon, had been appointed by Abbot Stephen Harding of Cîteaux,²⁵ and under Hugh's devout and capable management, the nascent abbey appears to have flourished. New vocations entered in a steady stream, and six daughter-houses²⁶ were founded during his abbacy of twenty-two years (1114–36). Hugh himself, however, does not appear to have been concerned with major architectural projects. The earliest living quarters at the abbey were probably made of wood, but we know that Hugh built a modest stone chapel which was large enough to serve the growing community for some time.²⁷

When Hugh left Pontigny in 1136 to become bishop of Auxerre, he was succeeded by Guichard, a monk from Cîteaux.²⁸ During Guichard's twenty-nine years as abbot (1136–65), the number of religious at Pontigny increased dramatically and nine more daughter abbeys were founded.²⁹ According to a *rotulus mortuorum* of 1157, there were at least fifty priests at Pontigny and a much greater number of non-ordained monks,³⁰ plus, of course, lay brothers. How and where such a large population was accommodated is not known. And if they all worshipped in Abbot Hugh's original stone chapel, it must have been under very cramped conditions.

The pattern of daughter-foundations, however, suggests that Abbot Guichard's priorities differed somewhat from those of his predecessor. Abbot Hugh had launched Pontigny's filiation in 1119 with two abbeys, and continued with two subsequent pairs of foundations in 1124 and 1132. This pattern was at first maintained by Guichard, with

additional foundations at regular intervals: two in 1137, two in 1141, and three in 1145. But after 1145 the established rhythm ceased. There was a single foundation eleven years later in 1156, then the attachment of a Benedictine house with its six daughters in 1162, and a last foundation, in Hungary, in the late 1170s. What was the cause of this abrupt cessation of paired foundations after 1145? I would suggest that one reason might well have been the completion of permanent quarters — including the church — at Pontigny itself.

Although construction at Pontigny is not mentioned in any extant medieval documents,³¹ they do permit us to follow the establishment of the abbey's holdings, the widening of its influence, and the exertion of its authority. Pontigny was founded in 1114 and the first transactions recorded in the cartulary were land donations four years later.³² The founding of new abbeys began in 1119, and the monks received further donations of land, exemptions from tithes and tolls and other privileges, while they sometimes exchanged or sold property in order to consolidate their territory.³³ By 1138 they possessed a nearby quarry³⁴ — they may have had another even earlier³⁵ — and in the same year Pope Innocent II placed lands held by Pontigny under his protection.³⁶ Four years later he issued a bull which, among other things, prohibited people of the diocese from vexing the monks in any way or collecting tithes from their property.³⁷ Pontigny had ten granges by 1156, the year in which they were placed under papal protection, and the pope banned building any closer than half a league from the monks' houses and farms.³⁸ Numerous other charters confirm gifts, exchanges of property, exemptions, rights of usage, and other privileges during this time from people of all stations — from popes and kings to faithful commoners. But although all this activity is clear evidence of industriousness, prosperity, and expansion, we still find no reference to construction at the abbey.

Post-medieval compendia are another resource, obviously more distant in time, but important in that they occasionally refer to earlier sources which are now lost. They also organise information in a way that may bring events into a different light. It is indeed here where we first find mention of actual building at Pontigny.³⁹ In his *De l'illustre et insigne abbaye de Pontigny*, Dom Georges Viole (1598–1669) described a lavish mid twelfth-century project, funded by the wealthiest noble in France, Count Thibaut of Champagne:

... l'abbaye de Pontigny ... fut obligée d'accroître ses espaces réguliers et enfermer dans ses murailles cinquante arpens de terre ou environ pour y bastir une des grandes et belles Eglises de l'ordre; un dortoir de cent sept pas de longueur, large de douze, avec des cloîtres, un chapitre, un parloir, un reffectoire des Infirmeries, chambres des Hostes, logis abbatial, et autres appartemens à proportion: le tout, ou du moins une grande partie, par les immenses libéralitez de Thibaud, surnommé le Grand, comte de Champagne, père de la Reine Adèle femme du Roy Louis VII, dit le Jeune, ce qui advint environ l'an 1150.⁴⁰

Dom Edme Robinet (1643–1720), writing two generations later, concurred that Count Thibaut had indeed made a generous donation:

... l'Abbaye de Pontigny ... fut obligé d'accroître ses espaces réguliers, et d'enfermer de murailles quarante deux arpens de terre. On y construisit une belle et grande Eglise, un Dortoir de cent sept pas de longueur, large de douze avec des cloîtres, un Chapitre, un parloir qui fut dédié, depuis, a S. Guillaume Religieux et Prieur de Pontigny, et un Réfectoire, des Infirmeries, un Noviciat, Logis des Hôtes, Logis Abbatial, et autres appartemens à proportion: le tous bâti, vers l'an 1150,

des libéralités de Louis VII, dit le

Two points are and claustral Count Thibaut Pontigny has for of his life and in the architect

Thibaut was Meaux, and Ac father's territori his sister, brothe have had a deep church (he and Preuilly (Seine- considerably aft abbey of Aumôn Saint-Jean-des- abbey in Blois,

Thibaut's cor the influence of see Norbert at P a monk. Norber the world than married Mathil when his uncle,

Twelve years year that Louis Thibaut's coun: 'Count Thibaut situation from w that Thibaut w

Unfortunately After the King came to blows. monasteries din to the Holy Lan they remained Count Thibaut was p Cistercian histo died and was bu

Thibaut's ger patronage of the Preuilly in 1118 construction of

des libéralités de Thibaud le Grand Comte de Champagne, père de la Reine Adèle épouse de Louis VII, dit le Jeune Roi de France.⁴¹

Two points are of particular interest here: first, that the building of Pontigny's church and claustral complex was accomplished 'around the year 1150', and secondly, that Count Thibaut the Great of Champagne was the donor. But while Thibaut's connexion to Pontigny has long been acknowledged, it has never been investigated, and a brief glimpse of his life and involvement with the Cistercians may help to illuminate the role he played in the architectural history of Pontigny.⁴²

Thibaut was born about the year 1093 to Etienne-Henri, count of Blois, Chartres, and Meaux, and Adèle of England, daughter of William the Conqueror, and inherited his father's territories in 1102 when Etienne-Henri was killed in the Holy Land. The death of his sister, brother-in-law, and four cousins in the wreck of the White Ship in 1120 seems to have had a deep effect upon him, for although he had already shown generosity to the church (he and his mother had donated land to Cîteaux in 1118 to found the abbey of Preuilly (Seine-et-Marne)), Thibaut's interest in monasteries appears to have increased considerably after this tragedy. In 1121 he contributed to the foundation of the Cistercian abbey of Aumône near Blois, and in 1122 he made substantial donations to the church of Saint-Jean-des-Vignes in Soissons.⁴³ In the same year he helped establish an Augustinian abbey in Blois, and continued as intercessor for and protector of Peter Abelard.⁴⁴

Thibaut's continued generosity toward religious institutions has often been credited to the influence of Saint Norbert. It is reported in the saint's *vita* that in 1122 Thibaut went to see Norbert at Prémontré and offered him all his possessions in exchange for profession as a monk. Norbert apparently suggested to Thibaut that he could serve the church better in the world than in a monastery, and advised the young nobleman to find a wife.⁴⁵ He married Mathilda of Carinthia in 1123 or 1124, and became count of Champagne in 1125 when his uncle, Hugues of Champagne, named him as his successor.

Twelve years later, in 1137, Thibaut's political power reached its apogee. It was in that year that Louis VII ascended the throne, and the young king was eager to accept Thibaut's counsel. In 1138, the author of the *Annales ordinis St. Benedicti* could write that 'Count Thibaut set the whole kingdom of France in order as deputy for the king, a situation from which the church also appeared to benefit'.⁴⁶ It was also during this period that Thibaut was most generous to monasteries, even those far from his domain.⁴⁷

Unfortunately, the co-operative relationship between Thibaut and Louis did not last. After the King reached his majority in 1140 the two men fell into discord and eventually came to blows.⁴⁸ It is not surprising, perhaps, that the Count's generosity toward monasteries diminished significantly during this period of strife. But when the King went to the Holy Land in 1147, Thibaut's donations to monastic houses began to increase, and they remained considerable until his death in 1152. According to Arbois de Jubainville, Thibaut was professed as a Cistercian monk shortly before he died.⁴⁹ Some early Cistercian histories maintain, mistakenly, that he was buried at Pontigny.⁵⁰ In fact, he died and was buried at Lagny.⁵¹

Thibaut's generosity to monasteries was by no means limited to the Cistercians, but his patronage of the Order is undoubtedly worthy of notice.⁵² In addition to the gifts to Preuilly in 1118 and Aumône in 1121 mentioned above, he provided the means for the construction of buildings at the new abbey of Jouy-en-Brie (Seine-et-Marne), the fourth

daughter of Pontigny, in 1124.⁵³ Again, in the early 1130s when his nephew and vassal, Count Ebal of Montfort, founded the abbey of Evaux-en-Ornois (Meuse), he did so with Thibaut's full support and generous participation.⁵⁴ Thibaut not only made a gift of land, but also donated 500 gold coins toward the construction of the monastery.⁵⁵ A short time later, in the mid-1130s, when the site of Clairvaux was moved, new and larger quarters—including the great church—were constructed at Thibaut's expense.⁵⁶ So important was this donation that Thibaut was sometimes called the 'founder' of Clairvaux.⁵⁷ In 1135 the Count also built a church for the abbey of Signy (Ardennes), a direct daughter of Clairvaux,⁵⁸ as well as contributing to the construction of Silvanès in the Rouergue (Aveyron) after its affiliation to Cîteaux in 1136.⁵⁹

Precisely how the means for construction were provided is rarely set out as clearly as at Evaux, but on at least one occasion Thibaut had given jewels to monks as alms, for the way in which they were converted into cash was described gleefully by Abbot Suger of Saint-Denis. The jewels had come from the treasury of Thibaut's uncle, Henry I of England, who (according to Suger) 'had amassed them throughout his life in wonderful vessels'.⁶⁰ They had been given to Thibaut in 1137 by his younger brother King Stephen.⁶¹ Suger, meanwhile, had been searching without success for glittering stones to adorn a golden crucifix, and his problem was providentially resolved when monks from Cîteaux, a second (unnamed) Cistercian abbey, and Fontevault came to Saint-Denis and 'entered the little chamber adjacent to the church and offered us for sale an abundance of gems such as we had not hoped to find in ten years, hyacinths, sapphires, rubies, emeralds, topazes', all received from Count Thibaut as alms. Suger did not disguise his delight: 'We, freed from the worry of searching for gems, thanked God and gave four hundred pounds for the lot though they were worth much more.'⁶²

There can be no doubt, therefore, that Thibaut of Champagne was an important patron of the Cistercians, but whether he was an important patron of Pontigny still remains to be determined. We know that sometime between 1125 and 1132 he confirmed the donation of a vineyard in neighbouring Saint-Florentin that his mother had made to the monks of Pontigny, while at the same time cancelling a debt of eight deniers' rent which the monks owed him, and approving in advance all donations made to Pontigny in his fiefs.⁶³ Again, in 1141 he witnessed an act wherein one of his vassals, Guerin de Venisy, exempted Pontigny from all customs on his lands,⁶⁴ and eight years later, in 1149, he exempted the monks of Pontigny from all taxes on the buying and selling of goods for their own use within his domain.⁶⁵ We are also told by Robinet and Viole that shortly after Thibaut's death in 1152, Thibaut's widow 'légua encore un clos de vignes dans la Vicomté de Saint-Florentin' to the monks of Pontigny.⁶⁶

Such notices as these, however, are not especially impressive, and none of them implies that Thibaut played any role at all in the construction of Pontigny. But if we turn to the *Speculum* of Vincent of Beauvais, we do find evidence which links Thibaut to Pontigny in much more than a passing way. Vincent tells us that Queen Adèle, the mother of Philip Augustus, was buried at Pontigny, which her father, Count Thibaut, is said to have founded.⁶⁷ Vincent's history, written around 1250, indicates clearly a close connexion between Thibaut and the abbey, and later writers, from the seventeenth century on, frequently echo Vincent in speaking of Thibaut as Pontigny's founder.⁶⁸ One is reminded of the similar situation at Clairvaux, discussed above: there too Thibaut was sometimes

referred to as 'founder' of the church in the 1130s. I made the construction used it—especially admiration from visitors homogeneous as the undertaken without exaggerated Thibaut's Count was gratuitous tradition that Thibaut provided most of the

The other matter 1 Adèle of Champagne 1165 gave birth to a 1180 he was buried founded in 1147 and to be buried at Pontigny immediately obvious where she founded a than explains the church father had built it,⁷ understand.

We must also remember the linkage here between the founding or rebuilding not *de jure*, and, as a This acquisition of property since many abbeyes had them, therefore, Thibaut frontier, but also let not do so without relevance to Pontigny county of Auxerre Champagne (to the who had approved cloister itself was Guillaume had been Thibaut's order for toward Pontigny m

It is also possible the house of Blois possible political connection the (Angevin) king 1164, an event which suggestion that if i

referred to as 'founder' after he had donated the means for construction of the second church in the 1130s. It is not difficult to see how the name of a person whose generosity made the construction of an imposing edifice possible would be remembered by those who used it — especially when it was a large and beautiful church, likely to provoke admiration from visitors.⁶⁹ It is also obvious that a complex as immense and as homogeneous as the church and claustral buildings at Pontigny could not have been undertaken without financial help from the outside. Thus, while Vincent may have exaggerated Thibaut's role in the history of Pontigny, it is unlikely that his mention of the Count was gratuitous. It is much more probable that he was reporting a contemporary tradition that Thibaut had indeed 'founded' the monastery, when, in fact, he had provided most of the means for its construction.

The other matter raised by Vincent is the burial of Thibaut's daughter at Pontigny. Adèle of Champagne married her father's former rival, King Louis VII, in 1160, and in 1165 gave birth to a long-awaited male heir to the French throne. When her husband died in 1180 he was buried at the Cistercian abbey of Barbeaux (Seine-et-Marne) which he had founded in 1147 and which he had intended as his mausoleum.⁷⁰ Adèle, however, elected to be buried at Pontigny, although the reason why she chose this location is not immediately obvious.⁷¹ Pontigny is on the border of Champagne — Adèle's native region where she founded and made donations to other monasteries — but this obscures rather than explains the choice. If, however, she held Pontigny in special reverence because her father had built it,⁷² her election of the abbey as her final resting place is easy to understand.

We must also remember that patronage could be intimately involved with politics, and the linkage here between the two has been examined by Michel Bur. Bur observes that by founding or rebuilding monasteries, Thibaut acquired the privileges of founder *de facto*, if not *de jure*, and, as a result, the prerogatives of guardian or avowry attached to this title. This acquisition of power became even more important from the late eleventh century on since many abbeys had been built in forests at the outer reaches of the county. By aiding them, therefore, Thibaut not only extended his presence and his influence out to the frontier, but also let it be known that anyone who wished to undertake a foundation could not do so without his consent.⁷³ This is an important point and one of immediate relevance to Pontigny, for the abbey is located at the extreme north-eastern corner of the county of Auxerre at the juncture of the counties of Tonnerre (to the east), and Champagne (to the north). It was Count Guillaume II of Nevers, Auxerre, and Tonnerre who had approved Pontigny's foundation in 1114 and within whose jurisdiction the cloister itself was located.⁷⁴ But in Thibaut's earlier battles with King Louis VI, Guillaume had been firmly on the side of the Crown, and had been imprisoned at Thibaut's order for seven months in 1115, and again in 1130.⁷⁵ Thibaut's generosity toward Pontigny may not, therefore, have been without political considerations.

It is also possible that Thibaut's generosity to Pontigny unwittingly created a link with the house of Blois that was to serve several decades later. Michel Bur raises another possible political consideration in recalling that Thomas Becket, during his battle with the (Angevin) king of England, Henry II Plantagenet, was to seek refuge at Pontigny in 1164, an event which has never been adequately explained. Bur has made the tempting suggestion that if indeed construction at Pontigny had been financed by King Henry's

treasury (given to Thibaut by King Stephen in 1137), the sympathy existing between the houses of Normandy and Blois might have been extended to Pontigny, allowing the latter to emerge decades later as a welcome place where the archbishop, adversary of the Plantagenet king, could go for asylum.⁷⁶

Let us now return to the central issue of this brief study: the date of Pontigny's construction. The date *c.* 1150, first mentioned by Viole and then reported by Robinet, Martene, and almost all subsequent authors, has usually been interpreted to mean that this monumental building project was *undertaken* in that year. But neither Viole nor Robinet were that precise; 'environ' or 'vers l'an 1150' is a round figure, not a *terminus ad quo*. Other evidence suggests that the church was actually begun earlier, and was well advanced, if not completed, by 1150.

The Bernardine plan, with its flat-ended chevet and one or more pairs of rectangular chapels off the eastern sides of each transept, was in its first stages of implementation in the 1130s. The church built at Pontigny at this time did indeed follow this plan, with three eastern chapels off each transept arm.⁷⁷ As we have seen, the construction of the church at Clairvaux was begun in 1133 or 1135 under Count Thibaut's patronage, and at Cîteaux, where plans were under way in the 1130s, the actual building of the church had begun by 1140. It will be remembered that Guichard, the second abbot of Pontigny, had come from Cîteaux in 1136. I would suggest that the most likely time for construction at Pontigny was at the beginning of Guichard's abbacy. Plans at Cîteaux were well under way and would have been fresh in the mind of the new abbot, who arrived at Pontigny to find it flooded with large numbers of vocations requiring more spacious accommodation. This is the moment when enthusiasm for large-scale building would have been at its peak. We know that the abbey owned a quarry by 1138,⁷⁸ and construction at Pontigny at this time may also be reflected in the number of charters, beginning in the mid-1130s, concerning the acquisition of forests, either by donation, sale, or usufruct.⁷⁹ Timber was, of course, essential for building. As for Thibaut, receipt of his uncle's treasury in 1137 would have provided him with a timely source of revenue to support construction at Pontigny, as well as at Clairvaux.

The length of time needed to build the great church at Pontigny is another indication of the quality of financial support. While this subject has also been a source of speculation (with estimates ranging from ten to fifty or more years), meticulous analysis of the structure leaves no doubt but that it was built very rapidly. Alterations are present but there are no breaks in construction, and the way in which the changes were absorbed into the fabric is an argument for — not against — swift building, of the sort one would expect with a wealthy patron.⁸⁰ A further indicator for early and rapid construction is the mysterious and abrupt cessation of new foundations after 1145. This coincides with the peak of Cistercian expansion when the largest number of vocations can be expected, suggesting that the monastery quarters were able by then to accommodate a significantly larger community.

It is apparent from the variety of attempts, extending over 150 years of modern scholarship, that no single element provides reliable evidence for dating construction at Pontigny. It is only through a detailed reading of the texts, coupled with a careful yet wide-ranging view of the history, that the many elements which influenced building at Pontigny can be interpreted coherently. The result, as I have shown above, suggests a

date for the be-
abbot, Guichar
ribbon of four
organisation an
of a rapidly gr
achieved with

Research for th
of Pontigny. The
assisted by gra
Council of Lear
H. Berman, Co
various drafts o

¹ Cîteaux (Côte-d'Or) 1113. This was followed by Jean-Berthold Mahr and Friedlander, 'Le gou...', 68–73; for a summary, see *Monastic History* (L...).

² See Terryl N. K... *Cistercienses xxxi* (198...), *Anselme Dimier* (B. C...).

³ For a reconstruction, see *Studies in Cistercian Architecture*, p. 255.

⁴ On proportional... *Architecture of the Cistercians* (Indiana 1982), 77–8. The influence from — or from — on Pontigny's design... of Pontigny (see *Key Historical*, 29 (1970)). XIIe siècle', *Bulletin*...

⁵ The oldest of the... in Auxerre (*De illustribus* 1651), 1610–1764). *l'histoire de l'Abbaye et*... is some confusion regarding... around this time. One... in 1720 at the age of... library MS 222), however... date by the last abbot... (le Cadet') took final... Pontigny documents... base an authorship... Institute Library, W...

⁶ Edmond Martene, *Pontiniacensis monasterii thesaurus novus anecdota*, date of 'c. 1150' with...

⁷ 'Pontigny', *Annuaire*...

⁸ 'Recherches sur l'histoire de Pontigny', *Annuaire*...

⁹ *Dictionnaire raisonné*...

date for the beginning of work in the late 1130s, shortly after the arrival of the second abbot, Guichard, and thanks to the generosity of a man on whom history tried to pin the ribbon of founder, Count Thibaut of Champagne. A happy marriage of excellent organisation and extensive resources, coupled with the fervour (and probably assistance) of a rapidly growing community, permitted the immense church at Pontigny to be achieved with celerity by or shortly after the middle of the twelfth century.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Research for this article was begun for my doctoral thesis, *Architecture of the Cistercian Abbey of Pontigny. The Twelfth-Century Church* (Indiana University, 1982), and has since been assisted by grants from the National Endowment for the Humanities and the American Council of Learned Societies. I would like to express my gratitude to Professors Constance H. Berman, Constance B. Bouchard, David N. Bell and Emero Stiegman for reading various drafts of this paper and suggesting numerous improvements.

NOTES

¹ Cîteaux (Côte-d'Or) was founded in 1098 and established its first daughter, La Ferté-sur-Grosne (Saône-et-Loire), in 1113. This was followed by Pontigny (Yonne) in 1114, Clairvaux (Aube) and Morimond (Haute-Marne) in 1115. See Jean-Berthold Mahn, *L'ordre cistercien et son gouvernement des origines au milieu du XIIIe siècle (1098-1265)* (Paris 1951); Colette Friedlander, 'Le gouvernement de Cîteaux', *Saint Bernard et le monde cistercien* (L. Pressoyre & T. Kinder, eds, Paris 1990), 68-73; for a summary of the origins of the order (with bibliography), see David Knowles, *Great Historical Enterprises: Problems in Monastic History* (London 1962), 198-222.

² See Terryl N. Kinder, 'Some Observations on the Origins of Pontigny and its First Church', *Cîteaux Commentarii Cistercienses* xxxi (1980), 9-19, and *eadem*, 'A Note on the Plan of the First Church at Pontigny' in *Mélanges à la mémoire du Père Anselme Dimier* (B. Chauvin, ed.), iii: *Architecture cistercienne 6: Abbayes* (Arbois, France 1982), 601-8.

³ For a reconstruction of the original eastern end, see Terryl N. Kinder, 'The Original Chevet of Pontigny's Church' in *Studies in Cistercian Art and Architecture* (M. P. Lillich, ed.), ii (Kalamazoo, Michigan 1984), 30-8 and figs 1-15 (following p. 255).

⁴ On proportional systems, see Hanno Hahn, *Die frühe Baukunst der Zisterzienser* (Berlin 1970), 175, and Terryl N. Kinder, *Architecture of the Cistercian Abbey of Pontigny. The Twelfth-Century Church* (doctoral thesis, Indiana University, Bloomington, Indiana 1982), 77-8, 174-6. Outside the Cistercian sphere, the date of Pontigny's church is significant in understanding the influence from — or toward — other major monuments in the region. Of particular importance is the effect of Sens cathedral on Pontigny's design — or vice versa — since the dates of construction at Sens are at least as open to interpretation as those of Pontigny (see Kenneth W. Severens, 'The Early Campaign at Sens, 1140-1145', *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians*, 29 (1970), 97-107, and Jacques Henriot, 'La cathédrale de Sens: le parti du premier maître et les campagnes du XIIe siècle', *Bulletin monumental*, 140 (1982), 81-168). Scores of smaller churches were influenced by these buildings.

⁵ The oldest of the post-medieval histories was written by Dom Georges Violen, Maurist and former prior of Saint-Germain in Auxerre (*De illustre et insigne abbaye de Pontigny. Abrégé chronologique*, Municipal library, Auxerre, MS 157 (written after 1651), 1610-1764). Somewhat better known is the three-volume study by Dom Edme Robinet (*Abrégé chronologique de l'histoire de l'abbaye et des abbés de Pontigny de l'ordre de Cîteaux, au diocèse d'Auxerre*, Municipal library, Auxerre, MS 225). There is some confusion regarding the date and author of this MS, since there was three monks named Edme Robinet at Pontigny around this time. One was prior of Chaalis, Bouras and Chalivoy before retiring to Pontigny in his later years; he died there in 1720 at the age of 77. It is usually thought that he was the author of the MS in question. In a copy of this MS (Auxerre library MS 222), however, is an inscription stating that the original was made 'toward 1740'; the copy was brought up to date by the last abbot of Pontigny. In the original, unfortunately, the last pages are missing; one cannot therefore verify the date of the final entry. As to the other two men, one was professed in 1689 for the abbey of Chaalis; the other ('Edme Robinet le Cadet') took final vows in 1692 for the daughter-abbey of Cercamp. The signature of one of these men appears in various Pontigny documents from 1696 until 1735; he was, in fact, procureur there in 1734, although there is nothing on which to base an authorship of the MS in question. An incomplete nineteenth-century copy is located in the Cistercian Studies Institute Library, Western Michigan University, Kalamazoo, Michigan.

⁶ Edmond Martene and Ursin Durand give the date of 'c. 1150', citing Georges Violen as their source ('Historia Pontiniacensis monasterii, ordinis cisterciensis in diocesi Autissiodorensi, per chartas et instrumenta ejusdem monasterii', *Thesaurus novus anecdotorum* 3 (Paris 1717), cols 1221-2). The compilers of the *Gallia christiana* (12 (1770), col. 440) repeat the date of 'c. 1150' without citing a source.

⁷ 'Pontigny', *Annuaire historique du département de l'Yonne* (Auxerre-Paris 1844), 116.

⁸ 'Recherches sur les anciens vitraux incolores', *Bulletin de la société des sciences historiques et naturelles de l'Yonne*, 7 (1853), 245.

⁹ *Dictionnaire raisonné de l'architecture française du XIe au XVIe siècle*, 1 (Paris 1858), 272.

- ¹⁰ 'Zwei Cistercienserkirchen. Ein Beitrag zur Geschichte der Anfänge des gotischen Stils', *Jahrbuch der königlich preussischen Kunstsammlungen*, 12 (1891), 93.
- ¹¹ André Courtet, *Etude historique sur l'abbaye Notre-Dame et Saint-Edme de Pontigny au diocèse d'Auxerre de la fondation (1114) au XVII^e siècle suivie d'un Essai sur la formation du Temporel*, unpublished thesis (Paris, École des Chartes, 1920), 49 and n. 1, citing Viole and Robinet (microfilm, Departmental Archives of the Yonne, Auxerre). Martine Garrigues (*Le premier cartulaire de l'abbaye cistercienne de Pontigny* (Paris 1981), 12) gives no citation, but follows Viole and Robinet.
- ¹² *Congrès archéologique* (1907), 203.
- ¹³ *Cistercienserordens Byggnadskonst*, 1: *Kyrkoplanen* (Stockholm 1912), 64.
- ¹⁴ *Die Baukunst der Cisterzienser* (Munich 1916), 16.
- ¹⁵ *Die Gotische Baukunst in Frankreich und Deutschland*, part 1 (Leipzig 1925), 310 and 312.
- ¹⁶ *Pontigny. Abbaye cistercienne* (Paris 1928), 7.
- ¹⁷ *Ibid.*, 33.
- ¹⁸ *Architecture cistercienne en France*, 1 (Paris 1947), 187.
- ¹⁹ *Recueil de plans d'églises cisterciennes*, 1 (Paris and Grignan 1949), 148.
- ²⁰ *Die frühe Kirchenbaukunst der Zisterzienser* (Berlin 1957), 108.
- ²¹ *Burgundian Gothic Architecture* (London 1960), 16–17, 163.
- ²² *Saint-Remi de Reims* (Paris 1978), 89.
- ²³ *French Gothic Architecture* (Berkeley 1983), 312.
- ²⁴ *L'architecture gothique en France 1130–1270* (French ed., Paris 1990), 532.
- ²⁵ Hugh of Mâcon, who had entered the fledgling order in 1112 with his younger friend Bernard, was one of the four principal abbots who, in 1116, assisted at the first General Chapter meeting (Joseph-Marie Canivez, *Statuta Capitulum Generalium Ordinis Cisterciensis ab anno 1116 ad annum 1786*, 1 (Louvain 1933), 1). See Abbé Lebeuf, *Mémoires concernant l'histoire civile et ecclésiastique d'Auxerre et de son ancien Diocèse* (A. Challe and M. Quantin, eds), 1 (Auxerre 1848; reprinted 1978), 302–16; Charles H. Talbot, 'The Sermons of Hugh of Pontigny', *Cîteaux in de Nederlanden*, vii (1956), 5–33; Gaetano Racciti, 'Hugues de Mâcon', *Dictionnaire de Spiritualité*, vii (Paris 1969), 886–9; and Constance Bouchard's analysis of Hugh's episcopacy, *Spirituality and Administration: The Role of the Bishop in Twelfth-Century Auxerre* (Cambridge, Mass. 1979), 51–67.
- ²⁶ 1119, Bouras (Nièvre); 1119, Cadouin (Dordogne); 1124, Fontainejean-en-Gâtinais (Loiret); 1124, Jouy-en-Brie (Seine-et-Marne); 1133, Saint-Sulpice-en-Bugey (Ain); 1133, Quincy (Yonne).
- ²⁷ See n. 2. The plan of this chapel was also discussed by Jean Owens Schaefer ('The Earliest Churches of the Cistercian Order' in *Studies in Cistercian Art and Architecture* (M. P. Lillich, ed.), 1 (Cistercian Studies Series 66, Kalamazoo, Michigan 1982), 3–4 and nn. 14–7), although an inaccurate version of the plan was reproduced (from Etienne Chaillou des Barres, 'L'abbaye de Pontigny', *Annuaire historique du département de l'Yonne* 8 (1844), fold-out preceding p. 105). The correct plan appears in both editions of V.-B. Henry's book, *Histoire de l'abbaye de Pontigny. Ordre de Cîteaux* (Auxerre 1839, fold-out following p. 404; Avallon 1882, fold-out preceding p. 463), and was reproduced in both of my articles.
- ²⁸ Little is known about Guichard (or Wichard). In later literature he is sometimes called Guichard de Beaujeu, although no connexion to this family could be made. M.-J.-J. Brial reported that the name Guichard was common in the Lyonnais ('Guichard, Abbé de Pontigni, puis Archeveque de Lyon. Sa vie', *Histoire littéraire de la France*, xiv (Paris 1819), 179). The only other biographical study deals almost entirely with Guichard's later career as archbishop of Lyon (Ph. Pouzet, 'La vie de Guichard', *Bulletin de la société littéraire de Lyon*, x (1929), 117–50). Guichard died in 1180 and was buried at Pontigny, July 28 is the date usually given for his death (from the menologium of Cîteaux), but Dom Georges Viole (p. 1633) reported that he died on June 24, according to the (now lost) obituary of Pontigny. Viole added that '... on monstre son sepulchre à Pontigny, proche et à costé du grand autel, vis à vis celui de Hugues de Mascon son predecesseur en l'abbaye, avec le present Epitaphe: Hic jacet dominus Guicardus archiepiscopus Lugdunensis secundus abbas huius monasterii'. No evidence of this tomb exists today; it was probably disturbed in the eighteenth century when the grillwork was built around the choir.
- ²⁹ 1137, Chaâlès (Oise); 1137, Les Roches (Nièvre); 1141, Le Pin (Vienne); 1141, Cercamp (Pas-de-Calais); 1145, L'Éstrée (Eure); 1145, L'Étoile, or Stella (Vienne); 1145, Trisay (Vendée); 1156, L'Île de Ré (Charente-Maritime); 1162, Dalon (Dordogne) attached to Pontigny with its filiation: Bonlieu (Creuse); Beuil (Haute-Vienne); Loc-Dieu (Aveyron); Aubignac (Indre); Prebenoit (Creuse); Palais-Notre-Dame (Creuse); and their daughter abbeys.
- ³⁰ This *rotulus* for Calonis (or Galonis), late bishop of Poitiers (+1157), was published by Edmond Martene and Ursin Durand ('Historia Pontiniacensis ... 1221–2):
- ... adeo ut ante annum 1157 quinquaginta saltem in eo degerent sacerdotus, ut discimus ex Rotulo Galonis episcopi Pictavensis, cum aliorum monachorum non sacerdotum longe major excederet numerus.
- The fifty masses offered from Pontigny in 1157 probably indicates the number of ordained professed at that date.
- ³¹ After the Revolution all Pontigny's documents were removed to a barn in Saint-Florentin. Some were dispersed or lost during this time (see Abbé Cornat, 'Rapport sur les documents concernant l'abbaye de Pontigny et la ville de Saint-Florentin et Notice sur M. Jean Depaquy, dernier abbé de Pontigny', *Bulletin de la société des sciences historiques et naturelles de l'Yonne* 12 (1858), 240–7). Most of the extant MSS are now either in the municipal library of Auxerre or the library of the Medical Faculty at Montpellier; others are dispersed in Europe and North America (see Monique Peyrafort, 'La dispersion d'une bibliothèque médiévale: les manuscrits de l'abbaye de Pontigny', *Cîteaux Commentarii Cistercienses* 35 (1984), 92–128). The cartulary, which is in Paris (Bibliothèque nationale MS lat. 9887), has been published by Martine Garrigues: *Le premier cartulaire de l'abbaye cistercienne de Pontigny* (Paris 1981). Other documents are located in the Departmental Archives of the Yonne in Auxerre, some published by Quantin.
- ³² Garrigues, *Le premier cartulaire*, 160–2, act n° 89, and 165–6, act n° 95.
- ³³ See Garrigues, 'Le temporel de Pontigny au XII^e siècle', *Le premier cartulaire*, especially 15–6.
- ³⁴ At Briennon, 12 km north-west of Pontigny: '... Notum facimus quod religiosus vir abbas Pontiniacensis, ad requisitionem et preces nostras, et ex mera liberalitate sua concessit burgensibus nostris de Briennone, ut ipsi, quamdiu dicto

abbati placuerit, capiant in p
Cartulaire général de l'Yonne, 1 (1891), 103.
³⁵ Garrigues, *Le premier cartulaire*, 160–2, act n° 89.
³⁶ Quantin, *Cartulaire général de l'Yonne*, 1 (1891), 103.
³⁷ Departmental archives of the Yonne.
³⁸ *Ibid.*
³⁹ The seventeenth- and eighteenth-century nobility associated with the abbey of Pontigny and the Becket in 1164 and the ensuing recorded only as a by-product.
 In addition to these two cartularies, part 1 (Paris 1717), *historique des Archevêchés, Evêchés et Abbayes de la prise d'Auxerre par les Français*, 1 (Paris 1717), 40 Viole, Municipal library, 41 Robinet, Municipal library.
⁴² As Theodore Evergates has shown, Thibaut's accomplishments developed the eastern holdings under his son Henry the Lit (1975), 2).
⁴³ Madelaine Renaudin, 'Cîteaux jusqu'en 1267', *Ecole nationale supérieure de la Trinité*, 44 Henri d'Arbois de Jubainville (1860), 256.
⁴⁵ 'Ex vita S. Norberti Archiepiscopi et de la France', xiv (Paris 1819), 179.
⁴⁶ 'Anno MCXXXVIII... utilitati feliciter consulente'.
⁴⁷ Robert of Saint-Marien Theobaldus Comes Campanie pauperibus singulariter multum Theobaldus quanta feurit et explicari.' (Robert of Saint-Marien, xxvi, 233.)
⁴⁸ One precipitating event was the repudiation of Thibaut's nephew by Queen Eudon, marry the sister of Queen Eudon of burning Vitry, one of the Vacandard, *Vie de Saint Bernard*, *Histoire de Champagne* (Paris 1844), 49 Arbois de Jubainville, 1860, 256.
⁵⁰ Such as Gaspar Jongelin and others. Viole (p. 1616) believed and Latinicum. To this history.
⁵¹ Max Polonovski, 'La naissance de l'art', lvi (1982), 51 and n° 10.
⁵² The mutual respect and affection between the monks of *de Saint Bernard*, 1, 254–62; (eds), *Sancti Bernardi opera*, 1 (1882), 103–54.
⁵³ Viole, Auxerre library.
⁵⁴ Sometimes called Vauzelle.
⁵⁵ '... Praeter ea dictus puer deuote tradidit, laudavit' (Departmental archives of the Yonne).
⁵⁶ Victor Mortet et Paul I. Mortet, *Le moyen âge*, II (Paris 1929), 103.
⁵⁷ Dom Le Boulenger, 'L'abbaye de Pontigny', 1.
⁵⁸ *Gallia christiana*, ix, 304–646.
⁵⁹ As reported in the chronicles (fols 1–23), published by Paul I. Mortet (1910), 386. See also A. A. Mortet, *Gallia christiana*, 1, 286–90.

buch der königlich preussischen

erre de la fondation (1114) au
es, 1920), 49 and n. 1, citing
gues (*Le premier cartulaire de*

rnard, was one of the four
anivez, *Statuta Capitulum*
Mémoires concernant l'histoire
erre 1848; reprinted 1978),
1956), 5–33; Gaetano Raciti,
chard's analysis of Hugh's
ridge, Mass. 1979), 51–67.
oiret); 1124, Jouy-en-Brie

Churches of the Cistercian
66, Kalamazoo, Michigan
tienne Chaillou des Barres,
g p. 105). The correct plan
ux (Auxerre 1839, fold-out
articles.

chard de Beaujeu, although
as common in the Lyonnais
xiv (Paris 1819), 179). The
of Lyon (Ph. Pouzet, 'La vie
nd was buried at Pontigny.
ges Viole (p. 1633) reported
on monstre son sepulchre à
esseur en l'abbaye, avec le
bas huius monastery'. No
grillwork was built around

s-de-Calais); 1145, L'Estrée
te-Maritime); 1162, Dalon
ne); Loc-Dieu (Aveyron);
eys.

Edmond Martene and Ursin

ex Rotulo Galonis episcopi

professed at that date.

Some were dispersed or lost
le Pontigny et la ville de
société des sciences historiques et
al library of Auxerre or the
ica (see Monique Peyrafort,
Commentarii Cistercienses 35
been published by Martine
uments are located in the

–6.
abbas Pontiniacensis, ad
one, ut ipsi, quamdiu dicto

abbati placuerit, capiant in petraría ipsius abbatis et conventus Pontiniacensis ...' (Mathieu-Maximilien Quantin, ed., *Cartulaire général de l'Yonne*, I (Auxerre 1854), 330).

³⁵ Garrigues, *Le premier cartulaire*, n^o 107.

³⁶ Quantin, *Cartulaire général de l'Yonne*, 1:549–50; *Gallia christiana*, 12:442; Departmental archives of the Yonne, Auxerre, H 1403.

³⁷ Departmental archives of the Yonne, Auxerre, H 1403.

³⁸ *Ibid.*

³⁹ The seventeenth- and eighteenth-century chroniclers emphasised famous men and women associated with Pontigny. Both Dom Georges Viole and Dom Edme Robinet (see n. 5) organised their MSS according to the reigns of the abbots, mobility associated with the abbey, famous persons buried there, and so on. Hence Abbot Guichard's reception of Thomas Becket in 1164 and the ensuing two years of Becket's stormy stay at Pontigny are described in detail, while other information was recorded only as a by-product of the people involved.

In addition to these two authors, see Edmond Martene, *Voyage littéraire de deux religieux bénédictins de la Congrégation de St.-Maur*, part I (Paris 1717), 57–9; Dom Beaunier and Jean-Martial Besse, *Abbayes et prieurés de l'ancienne France. Recueil historique des Archevêchés, Evêchés, Abbayes et Prieurés de France*, 6 (rev. ed. 1726; repr. Paris 1913), 87–9; Dom Jean Lebeuf, *Histoire de la prise d'Auxerre par les Huguenots, et de la délivrance de la même ville, les années 1567 & 1568* (Auxerre 1723), 268–75.

⁴⁰ Viole, Municipal library, Auxerre, MS 157, p. 1619.

⁴¹ Robinet, Municipal library, Auxerre, MS 222, fol. 4v.

⁴² As Theodore Evergates has pointed out, lack of documents has prevented anything more than a fragmented appraisal of Thibaut's accomplishments. In the twenty-seven years he held the lands around Troyes as well as Blois, he appears to have developed the eastern holdings previously ignored by the house of Blois, and set the stage for the rise of Champagne under his son Henry the Liberal (*Feudal Society in the Bailliage of Troyes under the Counts of Champagne, 1152–1284* (Baltimore 1975), 2).

⁴³ Madelaine Renaudin, 'Catalogue des actes de l'abbaye St. Jean-des-Vignes de Soissons depuis sa fondation (1076) jusqu'en 1267', *Ecole nationale des chartes. Positions des thèses* (Paris 1958), 115–8.

⁴⁴ Henri d'Arbois de Jubainville, *L'Histoire des ducs et des comtes de Champagne, depuis le VIe siècle jusqu'à la fin du XIe*, II (Paris 1860), 256.

⁴⁵ 'Ex vita S. Norberti Archiep. Magdeburg', published by M.-J.-J. Brial, in Leopold Delisle (ed.), *Recueil des historiens des Gaules et de la France*, XIV (Paris 1877), 229–30.

⁴⁶ 'Anno MCXXXVIII ... comite Theobaldo totius Franciae regnum post regem ordinante, & communi totius ecclesiae utilitati felicitur consulente', in Jean Mabillon and Edmund Martene (eds), *Annales ordinis S. Benedicti*, VI (Paris 1739), 313.

⁴⁷ Robert of Saint-Marien of Auxerre extolled his munificence during this time; 'Anno 1136 ... Florebat hoc tempore Theobaldus Comes Campaniae, pater orphanorum, & iudex viduarum, coecorum oculus, pes claudorum, in sustentandis pauperibus singulariter munificus, in extruendis coenobijs & erga religiosos quosque incomparabili largitate ... Porro idem Theobaldus quanta feurit elemosinarum largitione profusus & religionis amator & propagator eximius vix lingua sufficit explicari.' (Robert of Saint-Marien of Auxerre, 'Chronicon', *Monumenta Germaniae Historica: Scriptorum* (O. Holder-Egger, ed.), xxvi, 233.)

⁴⁸ One precipitating event of the schism was their disagreement over the archepiscopal election at Bourges; another, the repudiation of Thibaut's niece, Eleanor, by her husband, Count Raoul of Vermandois, seneschal of France, so he could marry the sister of Queen Eleanor of Aquitaine. Tension escalated on both sides; in 1143 the King took the extreme revenge of burning Vitry, one of Thibaut's towns, killing 1,300 people who had sought refuge in the church. (See Elphège Vacandard, *Vie de Saint Bernard*, II (3rd ed. Paris 1902), 185–8; Arbois de Jubainville, *Histoire des ducs*, II, 345–7; René Crozet, *Histoire de Champagne* (Paris 1933), 50–3.)

⁴⁹ Arbois de Jubainville, *Histoire des ducs*, II, 399–400.

⁵⁰ Such as Gaspar Jongelin, *Origines* (Cologne 1641), p. K; Angelus Manrique, *Annales Cistercienses*, II (Lyon 1642), 186; and others. Viole (p. 1616) believed this error occurred because of the close resemblance of the Latin place-names, Pontiniacum and Latiniacum. To this hypothesis, I would add the strength of the tradition already linking Thibaut to Pontigny.

⁵¹ Max Polonovski, 'La nef de l'église Saint-Pierre de Lagny d'après trois rapports d'experts du XVIIIe siècle', *Revue de l'art*, LVI (1982), 51 and nn. 68 and 69.

⁵² The mutual respect and friendship between Count Thibaut and Bernard of Clairvaux was discussed by Vacandard (*Vie de Saint Bernard*, I, 254–62; and II, 186–7); some of their correspondence has survived (see Jean Leclercq and Henri Rochais (eds), *Sancti Bernardi opera*, VII (Rome 1974), letters 37–41).

⁵³ Viole, Auxerre library MS 157, p. 1692; Martene and Durand, 'Historia Pontiniacensis', col. 1265–A.

⁵⁴ Sometimes called Vaux-en-Ornois. See Jacquot, 'Notice sur l'abbaye d'Evaux', *Mémoires de la société d'archéologie lorraine*, X (1882), 103–54.

⁵⁵ '... Praeter ea dictus princeps quingentos aureos in manus praedicti baudouini ad edificationem praefate monasterii deuote tradidit, laudavit et ratificavit omnia supradicta promiserunt que ambo nunquam in contrarium venire.' (Departmental archives of the Meuse, Bar-le-Duc, 16 H 5).

⁵⁶ Victor Mortet et Paul Deschamps, *Recueil de textes relatifs à l'histoire de l'architecture et à la condition des architectes en France, au moyen âge*, II (Paris 1929), 26.

⁵⁷ Dom Le Boullenger, 'Histoire des abbés de Clairvaux', Municipal library, Troyes, MS 2919.

⁵⁸ *Gallia christiana*, IX, 304–E; Léopold Delisle, 'Chronique de l'abbaye de Signy', *Bibliothèque de l'école des chartes*, LV (1894), 646.

⁵⁹ As reported in the chronicle of Ugo of Silvanès, written 1161–71 (Paris, Bibliothèque nationale, Collectin Doat, MS 150, fols 1–23), published by Pierre-Alois Verlaquet, *Cartulaire de l'abbaye de Silvanès*, Archives historiques du Rouergue, I (Rodez 1910), 386. See also A. Anglès, 'L'abbaye de Silvanès (Aveyron)', *Bulletin monumental*, LXXII (1908), pp. 41–60, and *Gallia christiana*, I, 286–90.

⁶⁰ Abbot Suger, *De Administratione* 32, in Erwin Panofsky (trans.), *Abbot Suger on the Abbey Church of St.-Denis and its Art Treasures* (Princeton 1979), 58–9.

⁶¹ This gift was accompanied by an annual rent of 2,000 silver marks from King Stephen as compensation for Thibaut's having renounced pretention to the English throne (Michel Bur, *La formation du comté de Champagne v. 950–v. 1150* (Nancy 1977), 289 and n. 18).

⁶² Panofsky, *Abbot Suger*, 58–9.

⁶³ Garrigues, *Le premier cartulaire*, 180, act n° 112.

⁶⁴ Garrigues, *Le premier cartulaire*, 130–1, act n° 58.

⁶⁵ Garrigues, *Le premier cartulaire*, 87–8, act n° 5; Quantin, *Cartulaire général de l'Yonne* 1:447–8; Martene and Durand, *Historia Pontiniacensis*, col. 1230.

⁶⁶ Viole, Auxerre library MS 157, p. 1718 (citing 'Robert d'Aucerre'); Robinet, Auxerre library MS 222, f. 44.

⁶⁷ In sequenti vero mense Adela Regis Philippi mater apud Parisios obiit, & in Burgūdia sepulta est apud Pōtiniacū iuxta patrem suū Theobaldū Comitem Crescentium atque Blesensium, qui praedictum vt dicitur monasterium fundavit (Vincent of Beauvais, *Speculum maioris*, 4: *Speculum historiale* (Douai 1624; repr. Graz 1965), Book 29, Chapter xcii, p. 1216).

⁶⁸ After publication of the *Speculum historiale* in 1624, Thibaut was frequently cited as Pontigny's founder (for example, by Claude Robert in *Gallia christiana* (Paris 1626), 635; Gaspar Jongelin, *Origines* (Cologne 1641), p. K; and in later works, such as Dom Beaunier's *Recueil historique, chronologique, et topographique des archêvechez, evêchez, abbayes et prieuréz de France*, II (Paris 1726), 842). This misunderstanding was corrected by Martene and Durand in 1717 when they wrote: 'They err, who say that Thibaut, the very pious count of Champagne, was the founder of Pontigny, as he was merely an outstanding benefactor of the monastery' ('Historia Pontiniacensis', cols 1221–2, paraphrased in *Gallia christiana*, XII, 440).

⁶⁹ This can be seen in architectural patronage in our own time (it is self-evident to anyone who has served on a building committee for fund-raising): rare is the patron who donates funds anonymously or does not wish the building to immortalise his name. I am not suggesting that Thibaut deliberately sought immortality by building churches all over France, yet this was the effect of his gifts, and perhaps prompted chroniclers to rhapsodise over less visible forms of his generosity as well (see n. 47).

⁷⁰ Adèle oversaw the construction of a lavish tomb for Louis at Barbeaux, and there is some question that she wished to be buried there herself, but was denied permission by the General Chapter on the grounds that she was not a founder of the monastery (see Alain Erlande-Brandenburg, *Le Roi est mort* (Geneva 1975), 87–8, 90–1).

⁷¹ For papal reply granting the request to her petition, see Martene and Durand, 'Historia Pontiniacensis...', cols 1244–5.

⁷² This question will be considered more fully in my forthcoming article on the reconstruction of the Gothic choir at Pontigny toward the end of the twelfth century and Queen Adèle's burial there in 1206.

⁷³ Michel Bur, *La formation du comté de Champagne* (Nancy 1977), 317–9.

⁷⁴ It is not known whether the first donations included territory on the north side of the Serein River in Champagne proper, but Pontigny expanded its holdings into Thibaut's domain at least by 1118 when the abbey was given a parcel of land just north of the river (Garrigues, *Le premier cartulaire*, 160, act n° 89).

⁷⁵ Achille Luchaire, *Louis VI le Gros* (Paris 1890), 101–2; Yves Sassier, *Recherches sur le pouvoir comtal en Auxerrois du Xe au début du XIIIe siècle* (Auxerre 1980), 75 and n. 73, 170–1 and n. 676; Bur, *La formation du comté de Champagne*, 283–5.

⁷⁶ Correspondence, January 1984.

⁷⁷ See n. 3.

⁷⁸ See n. 34.

⁷⁹ Garrigues, *Le premier cartulaire*, passim; M.-M. Quantin, ed., *Cartulaire général de l'Yonne*, I, passim; Departmental archives of the Yonne, H 1398–1775, passim.

⁸⁰ Evidence of the rapid building will be presented in my forthcoming article on the construction.

This paper examines the sophisticated parish church architectural historians believe. The church's documentation involvement of patrons is.

Little is known of the unnecessarily complex and choir simplifies one aspect

ST MARY DE HAURON
Sussex. Originally constructed still standing (Pl. VI). Each other, but the present

The church is first came to England from thirty-eight manors England and Normandy son Philip confirmed

Philip appears to property held in Sussex uncertain, and the donor took part in the First to his father's gifts. Fécamp was settled being deprived of his Pipe Roll of 1130⁶ confirmation of his son, dated to the 11 between 1093 and 11

William de Briou 1180s.⁹ William de support in 1212 and captives of the king grants to religious Abbé, Brecon.¹¹ T with the third Will merely to have served intention of transfer