What Constitutes a Mental Disorder & Who Gets to Decide?

The Complexities of Defining Mental Disorders: An Examination of the Evolution of Mental Disorder Classification and the Influences That Shape Our Understanding and Treatment Today":



The classification and diagnosis of mental disorders are complicated issues that affect millions of people worldwide. But who gets to decide what constitutes a disorder?

1 2 3 Ancient Beliefs Mental disorders were classified based on observable behaviors and symptoms. 2 20th-Century Developments Mental disorders were attributed to supernatural forces such as evil spirits or possession. Mental disorders were attributed to based on underlying causes and biological criteria.

The Medical Model and the DSM-III

The psychosocial model acknowledged the dynamic nature of mental illness and its connection to external factors like environment and conflicts. Criticisms of this model prompted the development of the DSM-III, which prioritised reliability and standardisation. As a result, diagnostic criteria for mental disorders were enhanced, enabling improved accuracy in diagnoses and treatment. Consequently, the medical model gained prominence in psychiatry, emphasising symptomatology and medication.

Limitations of the Medical Model

The medical model, although widely adopted in psychiatry, has faced criticism for oversimplifying the complexities of mental health. By viewing mental health as a binary condition, it fails to acknowledge the diverse and nuanced experiences of individuals. It tends to overlook the significant influence of environmental factors, such as social, cultural, and economic contexts, on mental well-being.

By reducing mental health to a set of symptoms and predefined categories, the medical model runs the risk of misdiagnosis and mistreatment. Individuals whose experiences do not neatly fit into these categories may be misunderstood or incorrectly labeled, potentially leading to ineffective or inappropriate interventions. Furthermore, relying solely on symptoms and diagnostic criteria can perpetuate stigmatisation of mental health conditions, as individuals may be judged based on their diagnosis rather than being seen as unique individuals with complex needs.

Who Gets to Decide?

Influence of Professionals and Patients

Psychiatrists play a crucial role in defining mental disorders, but there is a concern that their authority may restrict understanding and impede patient autonomy. To enhance treatment outcomes and establish trust, it is important to incorporate patients' insights and experiences into the decision–making process. By valuing patient perspectives, healthcare professionals can create a collaborative and patient–centered approach. Additionally, pharmaceutical companies exert influence on the perception and treatment of mental disorders through their marketing strategies and profit–driven practices, which can impact the choices and options available to patients.

The Influence of Neoliberalism

Neoliberal ideologies, with their emphasis on individualism and consumer choice, have led to the commercialization of mental disorders. Within this framework, the medical model aligns with neoliberal principles, giving priority to market solutions and profit rather than individual well-being. This commercialization can have implications for the understanding and treatment of mental health, potentially overshadowing the holistic needs of individuals in favor of market-driven approaches. It is important to critically examine the impact of neoliberalism on mental health care and consider alternative approaches that prioritize the well-being and autonomy of individuals.

In conclusion...the complex task of defining mental disorders encompasses the contributions of psychiatric professionals, patients, pharmaceutical companies, and neoliberal ideologies. Therefore, striking a balance between the benefits of the medical model and acknowledging individual experiences and societal influences is essential for effectively classifying and treating mental disorders.