Moving on:
The classes of ‘09 and ‘10

Kate Purcell and Peter Elias
The Institute for Employment Research, University of Warwick

Presenting findings from Futuretrack Stage 4: transitions into employment, further study and other outcomes, by Kate Purcell, Peter Elias, Gaby Atfield, Heike Behle, Ritva Ellison and Daria Luchinskaya.
Futuretrack 2006: the survey

- **AMBITIOUS:** Longitudinal survey tracking large sample of respondents from HE application in 2005/06 till Winter 2011/12.

- **INNOVATIVE:** Web-based; sample drawn from known population so biases can be taken account of; monitors decisions and attitudes in real time, not retrospectively.

- **COMPREHENSIVE:** includes the entire spectrum of UK full-time undergraduate HE provision, including to overseas students; applicants who did not proceed to HE in 2005/06.

- **INDEPENDENT:** Impartial policy-relevant analysis.
What we’re going to talk about

• What is Futuretrack 2005/06?
• Who are the Stage 4 respondents?
• What were they doing at the time of the survey?
• What can graduates do (or do better?) than non-graduates; what is a graduate job and who got one?
• What their experiences reveal about
  – graduate unemployment;
  – the impact of debt on career outcomes and options;
  – graduate pay and the graduate earnings premium
• With hindsight, what do they conclude about their HE experience and would they do the same thing again?
Previous stages of Futuretrack 2005/06 showed -

HEI and course choices reflected prior educational and social pathways:

• differing degrees of access to and information about HE options;

• social and economic contexts within which educational and employment choices were made and continue to be made.

A major concern of this study is the extent to which elements of these combine with the experience of HE to provide access to different graduate opportunities.
### Selected broad subject FT student profiles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>% Female</th>
<th>% Asian</th>
<th>% Black</th>
<th>% 25+</th>
<th>% professional managerial background</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ALL 2006 accepted UK applicants</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-clinical Medicine</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pharmacy etc</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nursing</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physics</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mathematics</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer Science</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mechanical Engineering</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economics</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sociology</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media Studies</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History by period</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design Studies</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Languages</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Futuretrack 2006 survey, Stage 1 (see Purcell et.al. 2008: Tables 3.3 - 3.5, pp.30-32 for greater detail, and Stage 4 report).
Distribution of the sample by educational and career routes since October 2006

- Completed undergraduate course, no longer full-time student: 60%
- Completed undergraduate course, currently full-time postgraduate: 14%
- Completed undergraduate and postgraduate course, no longer full-time student: 13%
- Started but did not complete undergraduate course, no longer full-time student: 3%
- Did not go on to study full-time and have not been full-time undergraduate since: 5%
- Currently full-time undergraduate: 5%

Source: Futuretrack 2006: Combined Stages 1-4 dataset; all Stage 4 respondents (weighted)
## What were they all doing in Winter 2011-12?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Current activities (2011/12)</th>
<th>Did u/g and p/g course, no longer FT student</th>
<th>Did u/g course, no longer FT student</th>
<th>Did not go on to FT study and have not been FT u/g since</th>
<th>Did u/g course, currently FT p/g student</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employed full-time</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed part-time, (1 job)</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed part-time, (multiple jobs)</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-employed</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed and looking for work</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FT study/ training, or FT research student</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>83%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current job appropriate for somebody with my skills and qualifications</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied with current job</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jobs done wholly or mainly by graduates</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Optimistic about long-term career</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Futuretrack Stage 4, all UK domiciled respondents*
## Current activity of UK home graduates by degree subject

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Employed*</th>
<th>Studying</th>
<th>Unemployed</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Medicine &amp; Dentistry</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business &amp; Administrative Studies</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subjects allied to Medicine</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mass Communication and Documentation</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative Arts &amp; Design</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mathematical &amp; Computer Sciences</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Studies</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering, Technologies</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interdisciplinary Subjects</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Law</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linguistics and Classics</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Languages</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historical &amp; Philosophical Studies</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biology, Veterinary Science, Agriculture</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architecture, Building &amp; Planning</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Sciences</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>All subjects</strong></td>
<td><strong>73</strong></td>
<td><strong>13</strong></td>
<td><strong>11</strong></td>
<td><strong>2</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Development of skills on courses and use in current jobs, Winter 2011/12

- Spoken communication - developed on course
  - Spoken communication - used in job
- Ability to work in teams - developed on course
  - Ability to work in teams - used in job
- Written communication - developed on course
  - Written communication - used in job
- Numerical analysis skills - developed on course
  - Numerical analysis skills - used in job
- Presentation skills - developed on course
  - Presentation skills - used in job
- Research skills - developed on course
  - Research skills - used in job
- Entrepreneurial skills - developed on course
  - Entrepreneurial skills - used in job

A lot  Some  Not at all
Gender and sectoral distributions of employed Futuretrack 2005/06 graduates

- Electricity, gas, water supply
- Agriculture, mining, quarrying (includes oil and gas extraction)
- Construction (includes civil engineering)
- Transport and tourist services
- Manufacturing
- Banking, finance, insurance
- Information and communications sector (includes media)
- Business services (includes legal services, computing, advertising, …)
- Distribution, hotels, catering (includes retailing, supermarkets, …)
- Education (includes schools, colleges, and universities)
- Other public services (local or central government, health services, …)

Female
Male
But what **KIND** of job?

A new way of classifying graduate employment

**Experts**: knowledge-intensive occupations that require them to draw on and use their specialist HE knowledge and skills in the course of their daily work, appointed to their jobs because of these. Examples include Chemical Scientists, Civil Engineers, Pharmacists, Solicitors, Physiotherapists, Chartered Surveyors, Airline Pilots.

**Strategists** are in jobs that require them to draw on and orchestrate their knowledge and/or high level skills to evaluate information, assess options, plan, make decisions and co-ordinate the contributions of others to achieve objectives. Examples: managers and directors, senior planners and strategists in the armed services, police force and other public sector areas.

**Communicators** require interactive skills that may be based on interpersonal skills, creative skills or high-level technological knowledge, capacity to access and manipulate information and/or an understanding of how to communicate information effectively to achieve objectives. Examples include Journalists, Actors, Conference and Exhibition Organisers, Web-design and Development Professionals and Marketing Associate Professionals.
All FT graduates in employment in Winter 2011/12 showing extent to which people in their type of job context were graduates.
## Occupational distribution of FT graduates currently in employment by broad sector

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Experts</th>
<th>Strategists</th>
<th>Communicators</th>
<th>Non-graduates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Information and communications sector (includes media)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other public services (local or central government, health...)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction (includes civil engineering)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education (includes schools, colleges, and universities)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business services (includes legal services, computing...)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture, mining, quarrying (includes oil and gas extraction)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electricity, gas, water supply</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Banking, finance, insurance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and tourist services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distribution, hotels, catering (includes retailing, supermarkets,...)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Current economic activity: selected STEM classified degree subjects

- Sports Science
- Biology
- Agriculture
- Pharmacology, Toxicology and Pharmacy
- Nursing

- Expert
- Strategist
- Communicator
- Non-graduate job
- Unpaid work
- Unemployed
Current economic activity: selected non-STEM vocational subjects
Current economic activity: selected non-STEM with less direct vocational or professional focus

Combinations within European Langs, Lit and related

- Expert
- Strategist
- Communicator
- Non-graduate job
- Unpaid work
- Unemployed
Current economic situation of current graduates by timing and extent of unpaid work

- **No unpaid work at any stage**
- **Unpaid work during course and having graduated**
- **Unpaid work after graduation only**
- **Unpaid work during course only**

Categories:
- **Expert**
- **Strategist**
- **Communicator**
- **Non-graduate job**
- **Unemployed**
Routes into employment, further study or unemployment

Graduates from three year courses

- Employed
- Studying
- Unemployed
- Other
Routes into employment, further study or unemployment

Graduates from four year courses
Routes into employment

Employment profile of all graduates, by SOC(HE)

- Expert
- Strategist
- Communicator
- Non grad
Routes into employment

Employment in non-graduate occupations by class of degree

- 1st - 3 year course
- 2:1 - 3 year course
- 2:2 - 3 year course
- 3rd - 3 year course
- 1st - 4 year course
- 2:1 - 4 year course
- 2:2 - 4 year course
- 3rd - 4 year course
Routes into employment, further study or unemployment

Types of further study for graduates from three year courses

- Undergrad
- Postgrad qualification or diploma (incl. PTC)
- Taught Masters degree
- PhD or other research degree
- Other further study
Routes into employment, further study or unemployment

Types of further study for graduates from four year courses

- Undergrad
- Postgrad qualification or diploma (incl. PTC)
- Taught Masters degree
- PhD or other research degree
- Other further study
# Routes into unemployment

Factors associated with unemployment spells of 6 months or more

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>More likely to be unemployed for six months or more</th>
<th>Less likely to be unemployed for six months or more</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Undergrad course of three years</td>
<td>Undergrad course of four years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male graduates</td>
<td>Female graduates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian, Black, Mixed</td>
<td>White</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle and Low HEI access groups</td>
<td>Highest and High, other HEI access groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative Arts &amp; Design</td>
<td>Medicine &amp; Dentistry, Subjects allied to Medicine, Education, missing subject</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower second class of degree</td>
<td>First Class honors degree, Upper second</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Debt on graduation

Debt on graduation: a comparison of expectations with outcomes

- Personal debt on graduation (expected end of first year)
- Personal debt on graduation (actual on graduation)
- Personal debt on graduation (expected end of third year)

England

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Debt Range</th>
<th>Expected End of First Year</th>
<th>Actual on Graduation</th>
<th>Expected End of Third Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Over £25,000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>£20,000-£25,000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>£15,000-£19,999</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>£10,000-£14,999</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>£5,000-£9,999</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Up to £4,999</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Debt on graduation: a comparison of expectations with outcomes

Scotland

- Over £25,000
- £20,000-£25,000
- £15,000-£19,999
- £10,000-£14,999
- £5,000-£9,999
- Up to £4,999
- None

%
Debt on graduation: a comparison by social background
Debt and its impact

Options after graduation limited by debt, by gender

- Wanted to do postgrad study
- Had to take p/g course near home
- Best paid job, not preferred
- Had to live at home
- Could not take gap year
- Other impacts

Male
Female
Debt repayment

Repayment of debt by current economic activity

- Employee
- Self-employed
- Studying
- Unemployed
- Other
- Not applicable
- Wholly
- Partly
- Not at all
Earnings

Distribution of earnings of those in full-time employment in 2011/2012, degree completers and non-completers

Completed u/g degree

Did not complete u/g degree
Earnings

Distribution of earnings of those in full-time employment in 2011/2012, males and females
Earnings

Distribution of earnings of those in full-time employment in 2011/2012, males and females, by subject studied
Earnings

Distribution of earnings of those in full-time employment in 2011/2012, males and females, by SOC(HE)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Expert</th>
<th>Strategist</th>
<th>Communicator</th>
<th>Non-graduate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>£0</td>
<td>£5,000</td>
<td>£0</td>
<td>£0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>£5,000</td>
<td>£10,000</td>
<td>£15,000</td>
<td>£20,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>£10,000</td>
<td>£15,000</td>
<td>£20,000</td>
<td>£25,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>£15,000</td>
<td>£20,000</td>
<td>£25,000</td>
<td>£30,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>£20,000</td>
<td>£25,000</td>
<td>£30,000</td>
<td>£0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What is happening...

... to graduate unemployment?

Graduate unemployment has traditionally been very low during graduates’ early careers (3 per cent).

Futuretrack graduates have joined an economy struggling to escape from recession – graduate unemployment in excess of 10 per cent.

... to graduate employment?

Much higher proportion of graduates in non-graduate jobs. 40 per cent of Futuretrack graduates are in non-graduate jobs. Ten years earlier we found 30 per cent in non-graduate jobs at this similar point in their early careers.
What is happening...

... to graduate earnings?

Comparison with a similar cohort ten years earlier shows that, at this stage in their early careers, earnings are lower relative to average earnings in the economy.

Analysis from Labour Force Survey shows that the graduate earning premium is holding up, but this applies only to those in the upper half of the earnings distribution.

... to debt on graduation?

We estimate that, by 2015, a high proportion of graduates from three year courses at English HEIs will have incurred debts of £50,000 or more.
Satisfaction of graduates with...

- **Promotion or career development prospects**: 14% (1), 21% (2), 21% (3)
- **Total pay (including overtime or bonuses)**: 7% (1), 18% (2), 22% (3)
- **The number of hours you work**: 15% (1), 24% (2), 22% (3)
- **The actual work itself**: 18% (1), 29% (2), 21% (3)
- **Job security**: 18% (1), 26% (2), 18% (3)
- **Opportunity to use your own initiative**: 20% (1), 28% (2), 21% (3)

(on a scale 1-7 where 1 = Completely satisfied and 7 = Not satisfied at all)
FT graduates’ satisfaction with current job (Winter 2011/12) - selected subjects to show range of responses

- Engineering, Technologies
- Subjects allied to Medicine
- Mathematical & Comp Sci
- Education
- Physical Sciences
- Law
- Interdisciplinary subjects
- Biology, Vet Sci, Agr & related
- Hist & Philosophical studies
- Creative Arts & Design
- Architecture, Build & Plan

Very satisfied Not satisfied
Change between Stage 3 and stage 4 survey in perceptions that ‘the undergraduate subject I studied has been an advantage in looking for employment’.

- Much more positive: 4.9%
- Somewhat more positive: 20.3%
- Same in both waves: 33.1%
- Somewhat less positive: 26.8%
- Much less positive: 14.9%
Agreement with the statement ‘the skills I developed on my undergraduate course have made me more employable’ at the Stage 3 and Stage 4 surveys
Changing perceptions of the extent to which course was good value for money at different stages of the survey

- After first year in HE (Stage 2)
- At end of final year (Stage 3)
- Winter 2011-12 (Stage 4)

1 - Strongly agree
2
3
4
5
6
7 - Strongly disagree
Implications for applicants and graduates....?

“I would choose to study Physiotherapy, or Economics. Something that would provide a more specific career path post university. At the new fees of £9000 per year Psychology would not be value for money and would not provide a strong enough career path to justify the investment” [Biology, Veterinary Science and Agriculture, Highest tariff university]

“With current fees I couldn't justify taking an arts degree and would choose something vocational... Which is a shame!” [Languages, Highest tariff university]

“English - I made a completely wrong choice and studied a course I wasn't passionate about or suited for” [Physical Sciences, Highest tariff university]

“Would have preferred to study a subject which is of more interest instead of employability” [Social Studies, High tariff university]

“[If starting again, I would choose] Geology - I chose a course that I thought would give me a professional career direction and structure opposed to a pure subject. Should have gone for what I enjoyed rather than what would give me more career options” [Engineering, Highest tariff university]
..implications for employers, policymakers and HE providers....?

“In a recession it's all about the brand of university regardless of the quality of the course/academics.” [Interdisciplinary Subjects, Highest tariff university]

“My University is not recognised as a 'red brick' University and has therefore placed me at a disadvantage in my chosen career path.” [Law, Lower tariff university]

“I get the impression that my university isn't as well regarded as others in the country. Despite the fact I received first class honours, I can't help but feel that a similar degree at a more prestigious university would increase my employability.” [Mathematical and Computer Science, Medium tariff university]

“As it was an ex-Poly University, I found that many employers would give preference to other applicants from red brick and Oxbridge Universities. I think the main reason for this is because they don't know much about the University, they tend to favour those that they know. This is despite attaining first class honours. I was frequently told my careers advisors that this would be a hindrance to my getting a training contract.” [Interdisciplinary subjects, Lower tariff HEI]
There is much greater detail in the full report, including coverage of themes that it has not been possible to discuss in this presentation.

The Stage 4 report is available as a PDF online, and it can be accessed and downloaded at www.warwick.ac.uk/Futuretrack and at http://www.hecsu.ac.uk/current_projects_futuretrack.htm