

Synthesis of Written Evidence Submitted to the Education Select Committee: Careers Guidance for Young People

This synthesis paper distils 'hard facts' contained in written evidence submitted to the above-mentioned Education Select Committee. It does not do full justice to the actual content and richness contained in each submission, particularly in relation to qualitative data. Instead, it is designed as an 'aide memoir', to individuals and organisations, featuring available facts and figures to inform new investments in careers guidance. The contents highlight similar and differing perspectives of young people's careers support needs; the requirement for improvements in careers support systems; and most importantly, the huge potential of young people now and in the future as they have to adapt in a rapidly changing global economy.

For more detailed information on each of the 85 written submissions visit:
<http://www.publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm201213/cmselect/cmeduc/writev/632/contents.htm>

1. Colin Dickerson – Careers Guidance professional

Submitted feedback based upon experience and knowledge of careers without reference to actual statistical evidence:

Careers guidance professional contribute to our commercial progress as a nation, helping young people to understand the requirements and demands of the work place. Equipping young people with a realistic understanding of employers needs will help them compete for jobs, provide suitable skills for employers, assist young people in focus and motivation. This will also help reduce truancy rates in schools, reduce dropout rates in colleges and employment with its obvious effect on NEETS, and reduce teenage delinquency with often feeds into criminality in later life.

2. Nick Von Behr, Behr outcomes

Submitted feedback based upon experience and knowledge of careers without reference to actual statistical evidence but made reference to several academic reports:

The quality of careers education, information, advice and guidance (CEIAG) provision, as with the quality of teaching, is an important facet of a successful education system. Lessons can be learned from those schools and subjects which are already ahead of the game, such as within the STEM area, and these should be applied everywhere. This could be focused at a localized level through strategic education partnerships. What matters is whether and how schools follow the guidance and the consequences of this - there needs to be a carrot and stick approach to monitoring, otherwise gains for social mobility from other Government policies may be jeopardized.

3. Association of Teachers and Lecturers

A survey by *Which?* has shown the current lack of access to one-to-one advice, with 39% of prospective university students reporting they received no one-to-one advice from a teacher or careers adviser. A further

22nd January 2013

43% highlighted a preference for access to more information. [2] Even back in the autumn term of 2009, a significant proportion of ATL members surveyed did not believe that students had enough high quality information, advice and guidance to make the most of opportunities on offer between the ages of 14 and 19.

[2] <http://conversation.which.co.uk/consumer-rights/university-fees-students-advice-a-level-results/>

4. Prisoners Education Trust

Feedback from young offenders indicated that some were not fully informed about careers guidance on offer in the YOI

Many young people we spoke to were keen to study to higher levels and should therefore have access to information about how to achieve this, either in custody (by courses provided in prison or via distance learning) or after release.

Many young people in prison want better careers advice and more opportunities to improve their employment prospects in prison through learning progression and contacts with prospective employers.

5. WHICH?

In our survey of recent graduates nearly a fifth (17 per cent) said that in hindsight they would have considered taking different subjects at school. Of the prospective students we surveyed who had received one-to-one advice (nearly 60 per cent of respondents aged under 19), 18 per cent said that it wasn't received early enough to inform their subject choice.

Our survey of prospective students also found that they are not making the most of the available information. Despite employment prospects being the main reason that applicants were applying to university less than half had researched employment outcomes of particular institutions at the point of making their choice and over 40 per cent had not attended an open day

In our survey nearly 40 per cent of students under the age of 19 had not received any one-to-one advice, either from a teacher or careers professional, but those who had were overwhelmingly positive about it.

The objective of Access Agreements is to widen participation and increase retention, particularly among the most disadvantaged students, and yet the majority of the funding (£528m this year) goes on financial support rather than outreach, which the evidence suggests is less effective at meeting these aims.

Our research found that students are not currently making use of the full range of information sources when making their choice of institution and course. Arguably whether or not students research particular issues depends on the relative importance of that aspect to them, but what was striking from the survey was the proportion of students that had not considered even some of the very key pieces of information. For example, while the majority of students had researched the course content, 22 per cent hadn't. And despite employment prospects being the main reason that students were applying to attend university (62 per cent said that this was one of their top three main reasons for applying) less than half had researched graduate employment performance when making their choice.

Students accessed one-to-one advice in a number ways: 49 per cent had received one-to-one guidance from a teacher at school, 21 per cent from a career professional in school or college and 4 per cent from a careers professional outside of school. Our survey findings mirrored UCAS figures on attendance at open days with 40 per cent had not attended an open day before making their university choice.

22nd January 2013

Our analysis also found that 39 per cent of students had not received any one-to-one advice suggesting that those who access one-to-one advice from a teacher are the same students who are benefitting from advice from a career professional. What isn't clear from this though is whether this was because it was not available in school or college or whether applicants didn't think that they needed it. However, those who had accessed it were overwhelmingly positive about it. Overall 89 per cent of those aged 19 and under said it was useful.

For the significant minority who reported issues with the advice they received this included how early they received it: 18 per cent disagreed that they received advice early enough to inform their subject choice and 12 per cent said they did not receive it early enough to know what grades they might need to achieve to attend university.

6. Adecco Group

Adecco Groups contribution to this inquiry primarily on the basis of their initiative, *Unlocking Britain's Potential (UBP)*.

....25% of employers we spoke to reported a lack of even the most basic skills in new recruits.

....Employers reported that in many cases young recruits were arriving into the workplace highly unprepared for the demands of working life.

41% of employers we spoke to said that interpersonal skills are most lacking in newcomers. Similarly, from our research we found that 91% of employers think that personality is more important than education and qualifications, particularly when judging between candidates who generally will have very similar qualifications.

On what do employers rate future potential?

- Attitude (91%)
- Work Experience (55%)
- Education/ Qualifications (35%)

Another key finding from our research was that many respondents felt that the careers education in schools did not give young people practical advice about the real world of work. Related to the previous section of this response, many employers believe that young people often under appreciate the team nature of the world of work, and the importance of interpersonal skills to interact and engage with colleagues effectively in the workplace.

Over half (53%) of employers say that university graduates have unrealistic expectations of working life – although just 18% think school leavers are generally better employees than graduates

- Over two-fifths of employers (43%) claim to already have an apprenticeship programme in place and these are considered to provide a cost effective resource by 51% of employers to fill a skills gap, and to better align employees to the organisational culture (46%)

Respondents also suggested that there remains more work to do when advising young people on the best routes to employment, particularly for those school pupils approaching the age of 16.

“careers education in school tends not to be great and is failing to give young people a realistic view of what work actually demands”

22nd January 2013

Clearly there are numerous options available to pupils approaching year 11, including sixth forms, apprenticeships and college, but many respondents agreed that there is still not sufficient information given to pupils in making these choices in relation to the future career which they wish to pursue.

67% of employers think that there needs to be a collaborative effort between government, employers, parents, individuals and the education system to ensure that those entering the workforce have the skills required by potential employers.

7. LOCAL GOVERNMENT ASSOCIATION

Over one million young people are not in education, employment or training (NEET). CEIAG, alongside other tailored local support services, is an important component in reintegrating young people in local areas. Local authorities are working innovatively to re-engage this group. However the Government's decision to contract £126 million Youth Contract for 16-17 year old NEETs nationally, rather than enabling all local authorities to commission it locally, was a missed opportunity, and makes coordination of re-engagement provision more difficult.

Over one million young people are currently NEET. With growth looking uncertain, there are few signs of a significant fall. Out of these, some 260,000 are increasingly marginalised for any number of complex reasons which are holding them back from participation. Re-engagement support should be more effective and coordinated addressing an individual's unique circumstances and complex needs

8. YMCA ENGLAND

The survey by ResearchBods in 2012 also found that 77% of A-level students said they were discouraged from studying a vocational qualification and 57% said they were presented as qualifications for someone less academic than themselves.

In a survey by Girlguiding UK, the top career choice amongst girls aged 7 to 16 was hairdresser or beautician. When asked why this was the case 35% of girls said one of the reasons was "It's all girls know about".

Research conducted by Edge in 2011 shows that 67% of academically-able young people in Key Stage 4 found it either quite or very difficult to make choices about what they will do the following year.

When asked whether they were given as much information about vocational options as about University, 76% of those surveyed said they were either given less or weren't given any information at all, in a survey conducted in March 2012

9. ROYAL GEOGRAPHICAL SOCIETY (WITH IBG)

No statistical evidence but the following statement:

In our experience the careers services on offer to and in schools are very variable and have not met that need for many young people. All too often there is also a lack of up to date and useful information for prospective students about higher education courses on offer and how the various study options at GCSE and A level support future careers choices. Without information such as this there is a risk that young people, and their parents, will not see the ways in which more traditional and academic courses, such as geography, actually deliver great employability benefits.

22nd January 2013

10. STONEWALL

Research by Cambridge University for Stonewall in *The School Report* (2012), a survey of 1,600 gay young people, found that over half (55 per cent) of gay young people have experienced homophobic bullying.

One in three (32 per cent) gay pupils who experience homophobic bullying change their plans for future education because of it. Almost a third (31 per cent) say they don't enjoy going to school because of it.

More than half of gay young people don't feel there is an adult at school who they can talk to about being gay, and one in four don't have an adult to talk to at school, home or elsewhere.

Polling by YouGov for Stonewall of 2,000 school teachers in *The Teachers Report* (2009) found that forty per cent of secondary school staff would not feel confident in providing information, advice and guidance on gay issues to young people

11. CEIAG Durham County Council

No statistical evidence but the following general statement :

Evidence from schools in our region suggests that some are not very well prepared to fulfil their new duty to secure access to independent and impartial careers guidance for their pupils in years 9 – 11 from September 2012. Feedback suggests that they are not confident that the arrangements they are putting in place will meet this duty. Also, the advice provided by the Department for Education in its Statutory Guidance (issued in March 2012) and *Securing Independent Careers Guidance: A Practical Guide* (issued in July 2012) is insufficient to meet their needs. Schools would like much clearer guidance about what they are expected to deliver, in particular what constitutes independent and impartial careers guidance.

12. Sheffield City Council

Overall 60% of the schools in Sheffield have bought some form of guidance but the remaining 40% are content to accept the Councils transition support and are still not developing plans for the end of this funding. See () below.

(There are two Consortium models being developed in the city: one in the south east involving three 11 – 16 schools and a 3 – 16 school; the other being in the North West involving two 11 – 16 schools and an 11 – 18 school. Both of the Consortium models are buying additional days to the 'free' days to ensure students receive the guidance they need to compliment the information that is available)

All secondary schools and colleges have been allocated a nominal 1 day per week of careers advisor input, paid for by the City Council, with an option to 'top up' this allocation directly from school budgets. All of the schools have used the resource to offer face to face guidance to Year 11 students between September and the end of January with additional support and guidance then being given to students to make appropriate applications,

In the academic year 2011 – 12 Careers Advisers from Sheffield Futures provided Vocational Guidance for 2,216 Year 11 students, with a further 1,105 students receiving Guidance paid for by the school. These 3,037 students received 4,159 separate interventions.

Schools with 6th forms have made use of the Guidance expertise to support students looking at alternatives to Higher Education as they feel well equipped to support students through the UCAS process. These schools also refer Y12 students for face-to-face guidance who are unlikely to progress to Y13. In the academic year 2011 – 12 141 Year 12/13 students received guidance with a further 43 students receiving Guidance bought-in.

22nd January 2013

A small number of schools still recognise the value of independent advice and guidance for students deciding on KS4 Options and this should be the case as Sheffield develops new initiatives like the University Technical College with an intake for KS4.

13. Hilton World Wide

In our experience, there is currently no national framework which can put schools in touch with business and industry to help provide such a service. We have over 100 hotels in local communities across the UK with 12,000 team members working across a wide range of disciplines who could go into schools and talk impartially about their careers and experiences. The same probably goes for many other organisations. Having a system that makes it easier for schools to engage with external organisations is important on two levels – it gives young people the opportunity to learn more about careers they perhaps had never considered before and secondly it gives them the chance to learn about employability skills and what it takes to be successful in whatever career or learning option they choose. This could also assist the drive to access independent careers guidance for pupils in school years 9-11 from September.

14. Working Links

Sample of young, unemployed people Working Links surveyed felt similarly let down by the careers services they received in school. Only 13% felt that the guidance available to them in school was high quality, and 56% rated the quality of advice and guidance as poor. Most revealingly however was that 85% of out of work young people say that the careers advice they received in school is no help to them in their current job search.

NEET levels are rising, in June 2012 TUC research highlighted that long-term youth unemployment had increased by 874% since 2000. We would submit that current provision is highly ineffective in reaching NEETs.

With youth unemployment costing £8bn a year, it is essential to help these groups into sustainable careers.

Working Links research found that 95% of employers felt that careers advice services could do more to engage businesses and employers to provide young people with careers advice and employability skills (Learning a Living, 2011).

15. Royal College of Psychiatrists

No statistical evidence but the following remarks :

The accessibility of careers advice is very variable and patchy. Our impression is that there has been a significant decrease in careers advisors / Connexions workers over recent years. Their knowledge of further education and employment prospects for those with intellectual disabilities can also be very variable.

16. Business in the Community

We have a consultation group of 20 School Leaders who help us to review and evaluate the development of Business Class. Through one of these consultations we discussed work experience and the impact of the proposed removal of the statutory duty on work experience pre 16. **23%** stated that they would be delivering less work experience in the academic year (2011/12)

As the recent CBI Education and Skills survey states, employers say the need to provide businesses with the skills they require is the single most important reason to raise standards in schools (73%).

The report continues to highlight that 69% of employers report weaknesses in school leavers' business and customer awareness and 61% report weaknesses in self management. This aligns with a recent survey of a

22nd January 2013

focus group of member businesses which revealed that 66% felt that school leavers' preparedness for the world of work was average or poor. However companies are keen to upscale their activity with schools, with the CBI report highlighting that 60% of employers would be prepared to do more in delivering careers advice in schools

Companies such as **Bank of America Merrill Lynch** support programmes that are embedded across subjects such as Maths but allow young people to develop skills including enterprise. Through their Financial Education and Employability programme run in partnership with Tower Hamlets Education Business Partnership, Bank of America Merrill Lynch have seen more than 2,000 students aged 13-18 benefit per year at three local secondary schools. Our members believe that it is through enhancing the core curriculum that young people will be able to develop employability skills.

One of our Business Class schools in the West Midlands concludes the following of the role their business partner has played in raising aspirations and therefore attainment:

"Our GCSE results have increased from below 30% three years ago to 45% this year. Whilst we put lots of initiatives in place for this cohort it is certain that Business Class input incentivising attendance and raising aspirations amongst some of our most disengaged pupils had an impact."

A 2012 NFER survey asked 700 KS4/KS5 classroom teachers whether they felt that pupils did return to schools following work experience placements more motivated: 68% agreed they did (17% saying pupils were much more motivated) with 6% saying they returned less motivated. Asked whether they felt placements increased the chances of young people on the borderline of achieving key targets (e.g. 5 A*-C GCSEs), 50% agreed that they did and 5% felt chances were reduced.

PricewaterhouseCoopers' mentoring programme at Harris Academy in Bermondsey has seen 80% of those girls mentored achieving higher than predicted GCSE grades and over the ten year mentoring programme the percentage of good GCSEs (A* to C) has risen from 19 per cent to 87 per cent.

Business Class is focussed on supporting schools in the most challenging communities, average Free School Meal (FSM) eligibility across our Business Class schools is 32% compared to a national average of 15.4%; 65% of our Business Class schools are in the top 35% most deprived communities as defined by IDACI and the average GCSE including English and Maths (at the outset of the partnerships) is 39%, versus a national average of 58%. As the example highlights weaving careers related activity into curriculum related activity is an effective way of motivating pupils from some of the hardest to reach groups.

17. City & Guilds

We asked the young people in *New DirectionsA*, who had received guidance from more than one source, who had given them the best information and advice. 21% cited a careers advisor at school, compared to 33% who rated guidance from their parents as the best. Careers advisers in school were rated more useful by young people whose parents felt 'unconfident' or 'neither confident nor unconfident'. 43% of all young people also received guidance from teachers or tutors, but only 25% of young people who got advice from multiple sources thought teachers offered 'the best' advice. This was mirrored in the qualitative aspect of the research, where young people spoke about teachers 'pleading' and 'being pushy' with them to take their subjects. This is an entirely logical consequence of the desire of teachers to maintain their subjects, and the lack of incentives which exist to encourage any other response.

In *Ways into WorkB*, there was a widely but not universally held view across the 14-16 and 16-18 age groups that teachers can only advise on one thing: how to be teachers. 64% of 14-18 year olds received careers advice

22nd January 2013

from their teacher – only 14% rated this as ‘very useful’ compared to 31% who felt this about advice from parents and 39% from an employer visit.

It is worth noting that 48% of young people received guidance from parents, but in the survey of parents, only 37% felt confident or very confident giving their children advice about vocational qualificationsA

According to *Ways into WorkB*, by far the most useful source of careers advice for 16-18 year olds was a visit to an employer with 88% saying it was ‘very useful’ or ‘useful’. Overall, only 2% of young people aged 14+ who have experienced an employer visit felt it was not useful or relevant to them. This is the highest level of engagement for any source of careers information, advice and guidance. Yet few get exposure to employers. Only 26% of 16-18 year olds and 16% of 14-16 year olds had visited an employer and only 50% of 14-16 and 53% of 16-18 year olds had been to a careers event at school. Just as universities offer open days, so industry needs to open its doors to schools for visits

The young people in the *New DirectionsA* survey received a fair amount of face-to-face careers guidance. 71% said they had got information and advice from someone about career/qualification choices, and of these, 67% spoke to a careers adviser at school. This suggests that just under half of all young people received guidance from a trained careers professional through their school. 25% of all young people claimed not to have received any advice at all. This figure was worse in *Ways into WorkB*, undertaken a year later, with one third of respondents saying they had not received any careers guidance.

73% of all 14-18 year oldsB, however, believe they have a good idea of the knowledge and skills they need to do the job they want, which suggests that face-to-face guidance is not regarded as essential by young people – they are happy to use their own sources, such as the internet.

In *Ways into WorkB*, the target survey group of 7-18 year olds was asked what sources they used for finding out about different kinds of jobs. Overall, the 3,000 young people in the group used different sources but 85% of them approached parents and 29% spoke to other relatives. The Internet was used by 65%, teachers used by 53%, books/magazines by 21%, TV by 16% and friends were used by 19% of the group.

In the 14-16 year old cohort, 16% had visited employers and of these 39% found the visit ‘very useful’, which was the highest satisfaction rating for any information sources in this age group. In the same group, 67% had received advice from parents, of which just 31% found it ‘very useful’. 44% searched websites, of which 26% found it ‘very useful’, 14% of the 22% who approached a teacher found it ‘very useful’, 50% received advice from a careers counsellor and 14% found it ‘very useful’, and of the 64% who had attended an event at school 14% found it ‘very useful’.

Approximately the same pattern emerges of satisfaction with information sources in the 16-18 years group. Visits to employers were carried out by 26% of them and 88% found it ‘useful’ or ‘very useful’. Parents were used by 65% of the group and 27% found it ‘very useful’, 53% looked at websites and 24% found it ‘very useful’, 62% asked teachers for advice and 16% found it ‘very useful’, 64% attended careers events at school and 14% found them ‘very useful’, while 62% discussed their options with careers counsellors and 12% found it ‘very useful’.

Overall, only 2% of young people aged 14+ in the research who experienced an employer visit felt it was **not** useful or relevant to them

New DirectionsA found that young people make choices while they are in learning which are largely based on subjects which they are interested in (74%) and which they are good at (59%). The percentages who chose subjects based on careers aspirations were much smaller (33% chose their subjects/qualifications based on

22nd January 2013

what career they wanted, and 25% chose those which would get them a job). This is in contrast with the young people who were working, whose choice of job was dictated more by practical influences. 29% of these young people took the first job they were offered, while 25% took the **only** job they were offered. 25% were able to choose the job they were most interested in, and a lucky 12% were already in a job which they had always wanted to do.

New Directions suggests that there are a number of aspects of adapting to working life which young people find especially difficult. 60% of young people in work found 'adapting to the new lifestyle' the hardest thing about working.

18. The Bridge Group

The evidence to date, however, suggests that students do not necessarily make consumer choices that are rational in terms of job prospects. For example, over the past decade, enrolments in Science and Engineering subjects have generally been relatively weak, despite their excellent graduate outcomes.

Underpinned by work with over 10,000 young people, research from Future First reveals the necessity for programmes which connect professionals with school pupils: 45% of pupils on Free School Meals do not have contact with anyone undertaking a job that they would like to do

19. CITB ConstructionSkills

In one instance known to CITB-ConstructionSkills, a student was forced to strongly defend his choice of subjects (chosen in preparation for a specific career) as this conflicted with the school's desire for all students to follow the English Baccalaureate subjects. This is supported by research undertaken Edge, an independent education foundation. Edge found that the **option to start a vocational course had not been discussed with a third of students and that 77% of the A' level students they surveyed were discouraged from pursuing vocational path. Almost 25% of the students felt their school was more concerned with sending students to university than focussing on what was right for the individual.**

The Local Government Association (LGA) survey that mapped the number of people currently in training against employment opportunities in different sectors. This clearly identified a startling mismatch in some sectors. According to the findings 123,000 people, including 44,000 16 – 18 year olds, were trained last year and there were around 275,000 advertised vacancies in construction. However over 94,000 trainees took hair and beauty courses last year despite there being just 18,000 vacancies advertised in the sector. Similarly, more than double the number of people were trained to work in hospitality, sport and leisure than there were jobs advertised in these fields.

20. ENGINEERING UK

In 2010, the engineering sector generated £1.15 trillion turnover, 25% of all UK turnover - three times the size of the financial services sector. Of the 2.1 million businesses in the UK, 550,000 are engineering businesses employing 5.6 million people – 19% of the work force. The demand for skilled engineers and technicians is strong; the engineering sector will need 2.2 million employees over the next 5-10 years.

Three fifths of the general public view a career in engineering as desirable, seeing it as being a 'good profession/career', 'challenging' and 'well paid'. However, our research shows that 21% of STEM teachers say that a career in engineering is undesirable for their students. This is especially worrying when nine out of ten STEM teachers see providing careers information, advice and guidance as being part of their role, and 8 out of 10 answer the pupils questions based on their own knowledge and experience.

22nd January 2013

Similarly only 47% of careers advisers and STEM teachers thought that a degree in engineering was an essential pre-requisite to pursue a career in the sector.

21. Education for Engineering (E4E)

The IET, the UK's largest Professional Engineering Institution reported in its 2012 Skills Survey [2] that more engineering companies are experiencing difficulty in recruiting engineers compared with 2011, yet more companies are looking to expand their engineering workforce. The CBI in its most recent skills survey [3] also reported that 42% of its members cannot currently meet their demand for people with science, technology, engineering and maths (STEM) skills. It highlighted that an even greater proportion of its members (45%) think the situation will get worse in the next three years.

The Royal Academy of Engineering has undertaken an analysis UKCES data [4] and Labour Force Survey data. It finds that by 2020 the UK economy will require over 1.2million people with Science, Engineering, Technology (SET) skills working across all sectors. Some 820,000 of these will be SET professionals and around 450,000 will be associate professionals.

E4E recently published research on combinations of qualifications taken at Key Stage 4 [6] . We found that across England 18% or nearly one in five young people were not entered for two sciences (GCSE and equivalent) and mathematics GCSE. This is a minimum requirement for progression in many science, engineering and technology roles. Our analysis also showed that there was significant variation between different regions of England and in some areas one in four pupils were not entered for two science qualifications combined with mathematics. We also found that only 50% of the cohort achieved A*-C grades in two science GCSEs (or equivalent qualifications) and A*-C in mathematics GCSE.

22. Princes Trust

Last month our survey of staff, delivery partners and volunteers [1] – which has 559 responses to date – showed that only 5.3 per cent think that careers IAG is currently effective or very effective, compared to 68.9 per cent who believe it is ineffective or very ineffective.

Recent research conducted by a group of our young people on our 'Listen Up' project [3] looked into RPA and found that 48.5% of those in their community [4] were not aware that RPA was due to be introduced from September 2013, let alone what exactly it involves.

23. Careers Sector Stakeholders Alliance (CSSA)

Evidence from a survey of 238 schools by ICG [12] during early-stage planning in late 2011 showed that:

- Just under half (49 per cent) of schools were planning to buy in impartial career guidance services from external careers guidance providers, independent careers advisers, freelancers or others.
- Just over one third (34 per cent) of schools were planning to use teachers and/or non-teaching staff to deliver career guidance.
- Eight per cent of schools were intending to do nothing, or simply to refer pupils to websites and other online services.
- One in three were still undecided.

22nd January 2013

An informal poll by Careers England confirmed these patterns and suggested that:

- about a third of schools will buy in independent careers advisers (but spending much less money on this than previous Connexions provision);
- about a third will largely make their own internal arrangements, of varying quality;
- about a third will do little or nothing.

The ICG survey shows that nearly all schools (98 per cent) said that face-to-face guidance is 'very important' or 'quite important'. Nine out of 10 schools want a combination of face-to-face guidance, visiting speakers, access to websites and telephone helplines, but face-to-face guidance from an independent careers adviser remains the most popular choice.

A new research review by iCeGS and the Pearson Think Tank indicates that the most effective mode of delivery for careers work in schools is a curriculum-led approach, in which career is seen as an important focal point for learning, with a body of knowledge, skills and pedagogic approaches connected with it.

24. National Institute of Adult Continuing Education

No supporting statistical evidence submitted but the following remarks :

NIACE shares the perception of many commentators that the recent reforms to young people's career guidance will have the effect of reducing the volume and quality of service. The National Careers Service is intended to provide access to high quality guidance for everyone aged 13 and above. This should mean that there is a coherent, seamless service which supports people to make and act on decisions about learning and work across all the transition points into and throughout adulthood. Instead, most under-19s and all those under 18 are not guaranteed access to individual, in-depth support from a professional careers adviser, however complex and challenging their circumstances may be. Most worryingly, there is no guaranteed access at all to career guidance for those young adults who are outside the school system. Those young people who, by their circumstances, are most at risk of being excluded from educational and employment opportunities - such as care leavers, lone parents and carers and those with disabilities and learning difficulties – are least likely to be in a position to access the support they need. While it is to be hoped that they will subsequently be picked up by adult services, it is clearly an ineffective and inefficient system which permits such gaps to exist in the first place. The cost to the public purse of young people making uninformed decisions before the age of 19 are felt throughout the adult lifecourse.

25. Cambridge Assessment

Dearden et al. (2002) used the 1991 sweep of the National Child Development Study and the 1998 Labour Force Survey and found that the returns to vocational qualifications were more similar to those of academic qualifications when they controlled for time taken to gain the qualification. Length of time taken to gain a qualification is an important factor as vocational qualifications often take a shorter time to gain than academic qualifications.

26. National Careers Council

A survey of careers providers in 41 local authorities (LAs) [17] showed there to be a total of 455,055 **individual face to face interviews with young people in compulsory education**, excluding face to face group work in

22nd January 2013

schools. A simple extrapolation of this figure would exceed 1 million face to face interviews nationally in any one academic year.

in **Denmark**, a National Dialogue Forum is firmly embedded within a clear legislative directive which outlines specific responsibilities and priorities and in **Greece** a National System for Quality Assurance of Life Long Learning (P3)" incorporates principles and quality indicators for Career Guidance underpinned by legislation. However, this is an exception rather than common practice across the EU.

27. vInspired

Research demonstrates the effectiveness of volunteering in preparing young people for work and learning. [1]

[1] Volunteering: Supporting Transitions , vInspired/Institute for Employment Studies, 2011
vinspired.org/resources/18

28. North Tyneside Youth Council

No statistical evidence submitted but following a discussion workshop with young people the following recommendations emerged :

We would like young people to have more opportunities to have face-face meetings with professional advisers and to allow the adviser more time to get to know you over a longer period of time – not just during Year 10 or 11.

Work experience can be really helpful in deciding which subjects to take in support of career ideas but there is not enough range of work placements due to restrictions in what young people can see and do, where they can go and how often they can do it. Regular work experience and work tasters should be an entitlement for everyone and there should be more chances to learn about different types work in school from people who have the skills, knowledge and experience. This should be available both at age 14/15 and again at 16/17.

The help and support with making career choices varies from one school to another - in some there's lots done around careers and in others very little. We think there should be a consistent and standard approach for all schools.

Finding out about careers and about what subjects work best with your career ideas shouldn't just happen in Year 10 and 11. We think it should begin much sooner – from Year 7 at least so that we have the time to check out our ideas, to change our minds if we wish to and to see what other options there might be.

29. The Work Foundation

There is a strong link between careers guidance and the choices young people make upon leaving school, particularly if employers are involved in provision. The evidence suggests that the inclusion of employers in the provision of careers guidance has a profound and positive impact upon a young person's confidence, the likelihood of whether they are NEET or non-NEET, and their future earnings. Employers, as well as third sector organisations, should play a more central role in the provision of careers guidance.

7% who recalled four or more employer-related activities while at school were five times less likely to be NEET and earned, on average, 16% more than peers who recalled no activities.

Sissons and Jones have shown that young people are increasingly struggling to make the initial transition from education into sustained work. [6] They found that on leaving education, some 48 per cent of NEETs have no experience of paid work; this figure has increased from 41 per cent in 2001.

22nd January 2013

30. NASUWT

No Statistical evidence available but within the executive summary the following :

To allow schools to offer only the careers advice that they deem to be appropriate will result in a narrowing of options, access to professional careers advice will be subject to unacceptable degrees of variation and the entitlement of young people to this provision will be undermined and reduced to a post-code lottery.

The need for an independent, external careers service is imperative and it is necessary that all learners have access to these services that are high-quality, effective and proactive in their responses to meet the requirements of young people.

·The resource implications for ensuring that all students are able to receive the information, advice and guidance (IAG) at times and in formats that reflect their needs is a critical issue to be addressed.

·The most effective and valuable IAG is that delivered on a one-to-one basis by an appropriately trained professional careers adviser with whom the young person concerned has had the opportunity to develop a constructive and trusting relationship.

·Work-related learning, including careers-related IAG must be regarded as a core educational entitlement for all pupils.

International evidence from studies by the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development ([OECD](#)) ([2004](#)) [[2](#)] and ([2008](#)) [[3](#)] shows that when career guidance is provided by schools it can be too remote from the labour market, too personal and too linked to the self-interest of particular institutions.

The OECD reported that the most effective IAG is that delivered on a one-to-one basis by an appropriately trained professional careers adviser with whom the young person concerned has had the opportunity to develop a constructive and trusting relationship. Research by Whiston, Sexton and Lasoff (1998) [[5](#)] has shown that individual face-to-face guidance has the greatest impact, followed by group counselling and classroom interventions. Computer-delivered interventions and other counsellor-free approaches are the least effective.

31. City of York Council

No statistical data available but the following practise has been established :

The City of York Council (CYC) has continued to prioritise support for schools' delivery of their duties in this area by maintaining a team of appropriately qualified careers professionals, despite budget pressures, to help ensure that all young people are able to access high quality impartial advice, guidance and support.

(3)Eight out of ten secondary schools in York have commissioned additional capacity from the CYC team which has guaranteed that they are able to fulfil their statutory duty and that the quality of the support received by the majority of young people in the city can be assured. The remaining two have chosen to make other arrangements and we have drawn their attention to the relevant guidance on fulfilling their statutory duties.

32. Prospects Services

No statistical evidence submitted. The following summary:-

It is Prospects' experience and belief that:

22nd January 2013

Careers guidance should equip learners with skills and knowledge to make effective choices, making sense of the myriad of conflicting sources of information.

Quality and impartiality of provision has become more variable with the demise of the Connexions service, and removal of local authorities' duty to provide careers education.

School preparedness to take on new duty varies considerably. Many are ill-prepared with nothing in place for this autumn term.

Face-to-face careers guidance remains an important priority in some areas, but others are overly reliant upon referral to National Careers Service web and phone advice.

Careers guidance should be available from age 13-19 to support individual decision making at key transition points.

Local authorities should facilitate effective commissioning of services and provision of area-wide support services, as well as helping develop partnerships and networks.

Targeted support should be more effectively co-ordinated to avoid duplication and increase social mobility.

Careers guidance is critical to the choices young people make when they leave school. It can be strengthened by involving teachers, parents and young people in the guidance process.

The overall coherence of careers guidance for young people has been damaged by recent changes, introducing greater inconsistency and inequity.

A unifying strategy and minimum entitlement for careers guidance is needed to redefine it as crucial and essential element of school life.

33. Careers Solutions

No statistical data submitted but the following extract from the executive summary was made :

Many Connexions services have been disbanded and schools now have a duty to secure careers guidance. However, as schools have not received any additional funding for this careers guidance no longer has a consistent approach and access to impartial and independent face-to-face careers guidance for young people varies greatly.

34. Joint UK Geo Science Community Response

Asked which of a range of information sources were important in their decision to study geoscience, 43% said that their school or sixth form careers service was important or very important. Other factors were: Family/friends (51% important or very important); University careers services (46%); School/college teacher (81%); University course information (94%); Information from the Geological Society (22%); Information from the British Geological Survey (18%); Media (25%).

When asked what further information would have helped them choose their degree subject, many students reported that they had access to sufficient information on which to base their decision. The most commonly cited areas of information deficit were: lack of information about subsequent career prospects (14%); and poor availability of information in schools/sixth form colleges (11%).

35. Mike Hoyer – Guidance Team Leader

No statistical data but the following opinion based upon experience :

The former Connexions Service ensured a coherent, quality provision of careers guidance that was well known by young people, their parents, schools, colleges, training providers, etc. It acted as a hub that all those with an interest in careers could work through and with. The present system is fragmented and confusing for all, which will inevitably lead to some very poor practice (if it is available at all) over the next few years, of which the young person will bear the brunt.

36. Creative and Cultural Skills

From a standing start of zero in 2008, more than 1,800 learners are currently undertaking, or have completed, a Creative Apprenticeship. It is also significant that during a period in which youth unemployment is a key concern, almost 90% of Creative Apprentices either stay with their employer or gain employment with another company in the industry upon completion of their apprenticeship [1]. Many careers services fail to signpost students towards opportunities such as this, focusing instead on routes into Higher Education.

Our research indicates that despite the fact that almost 60% of the creative and cultural workforce are educated to degree level, the industry continues to face considerable skills gaps and shortages, suggesting that students are not necessarily being directed towards the educational courses which provide them with the most marketable and industry-relevant skills

Creative & Cultural Skills, Assessing the Return on Investment, Evaluation and Impact of Creative Apprenticeships (2011).

37. Federation of Small Businesses

In a recent survey [1] of FSB members, 40 per cent said that if better careers guidance were provided, young people would be better prepared for work in a small business. 36 per cent said that an increased awareness of SME jobs and career opportunities would also help achieve the same aim.

Students need to be provided with the education necessary that allows them to make decisions about the pathways into employment. They need to have the 'soft skills' necessary to do this. Recent FSB statistics show that 57 per cent of members felt that school leavers rated poorly or very poorly when it comes to having a positive attitude to work and self-management skills [7].

There are a growing number of charities facilitating school/business engagement. Schools should be encouraged to make use of organisations like Inspiring the Future or Young Enterprise to get more pupils thinking about self employment and exposing them to the workplace and small businesses. 77 per cent of FSB members said that school leavers had either poor or very poor business awareness. Increasing exposure to the work place and education about career options in small businesses could help address this concern

The FSB would like further consideration of what else would facilitate business involvement with schools. Only two per cent of members have been asked by their local schools to become a school governor [8]. Potentially there could be a requirement that at least one member should come from the local business community.

38. Association of Colleges

272 Colleges (78%) of AoC members hold the matrix [8] standard which guarantees that their careers guidance is independent.

22nd January 2013

There are perverse incentives in the current system which allows new schools to be established even where there is an oversupply of places. In this competitive environment, schools are trying to maintain their pupil numbers throughout compulsory education and up to 18 years old. This mitigates against the provision of truly independent information, advice and guidance because such advice might, for example, recommend that a young person moves to a College or somewhere other than the school sixth form. In a survey of Colleges conducted by AoC in March 2012 [9] only 18% of Colleges reported that they had significant access to school pupils to inform them of the courses they offer. 74% of Colleges reported that schools would not even distribute their prospectuses

Colleges on the other hand, provide extensive facilities for careers guidance which go beyond their funding obligations cited above. In the same AoC survey Colleges reported that they have the following facilities:

Facilities for access to web-based career tools	90%
College-based careers hub/information resource	93%
Open access careers centre	64%
One-stop shop facility (offering careers and employability advice)	64%
Other	16%

Just fewer than 60% of Colleges reported that they provided impartial guidance to all young people and adults in their community. The survey also indicated that Colleges have qualified staff to ensure independent careers advice with over a third having at least one person qualified to Level 4 and Level 6 and a quarter with two staff trained to these levels.

An independent researcher was commissioned by AoC in September 2011 to survey 500 14 year olds on their knowledge of choices available to them at 16. [18] The research found that:

·while 63% of young people were able to name A-Levels as a post-GCSE qualification, very few could name any of the other choices available.

·Only 7% of pupils were able to name Apprenticeships as a post-GCSE qualification.

·Only 26% of pupils were able to name NVQs

·Only 19% of pupils were able to name BTECs

·Only 9% of pupils were able to name Diplomas

·Only 3% of pupils were able to name Foundation learning courses

·38% of respondents felt their parents were the most reliable source of advice on options post 16 and 35% felt they had not had enough advice to make the right decision.

Whether a school has its own sixth form is often the determining factor when it is deciding whether to allow other local education providers to inform their pupils about post-16 options. The following tables are taken from the same survey of Colleges cited above. [19]

11-16 Schools	Percent	11-18 Schools	Percent
Providing pupils with significant access to information about the College offer	55%	Providing pupils with significant access to information about the College offer	18%
Providing pupils with some access to information about the College offer, but could do more	31%	Providing pupils with some access to information about the College offer, but could do more	31%
Providing pupils with poor, limited or no access to information about the College offer	14%	Providing pupils with poor, limited or no access to information about the College offer	51%

39. EEF Manufacturers Association

No statistical evidence but the following recommendations:

We have therefore made the following recommendations throughout our submission:

(i)Careers ‘awareness’ or ‘inspiration’ should begin in Primary School, with careers ‘guidance’ being introduced later at Secondary School.

(ii)The good work of external organisations that promote specific careers, such as Primary Engineer, should be embedded in other subject lessons.

(iii)The current guidance for schools should be more assertive as to what should be delivered and head teachers should ensure that teachers are given clear objectives as to what careers provision should achieve.

(iv)Government should explore ways to incentivise schools to offer alternative pathways such as Higher Apprenticeships.

(v)Work experience should be seen as beneficial at both KS4 and KS5 and should be encouraged at both Key Stages.

(vi)Government should explore the possibility of assessing employability within schools to encourage schools to be proactive in getting young people prepared for the world of work.

(vii)There should be a compulsory professional development requirement for teachers to spend between two to five working days a year each within a business to gain first-hand experience of the workplace.

(viii)Average earnings of occupations, specifically STEM roles should be published in a place accessible to all young people.

(ix)Government must be fully committed to programmes that promote specific industries such as *See Inside Manufacturing* and ensure that demand from schools meets the supply provided by employers. Furthermore, it must encourage those schools and businesses that are currently unengaged in such activities.

(x)We must increase the number of specialist STEM teachers in schools.

22nd January 2013

(xi) We must allow state schools, as well as Free Schools and Academies, to employ professionals without Qualified Teacher Status (QTS) to both ensure an even playing field and give all pupils access to be taught by industry professionals.

(xii) Government must develop a one-stop-shop that coordinates the different schemes that help broker the relationship between schools and local employers with guidance to help businesses decide which one(s) will be most suitable for them.

40. Suffolk County Council

The situation in Suffolk regarding mainstream schools and academies preparedness for their new careers guidance responsibilities is as follows:-

· Approximately **8%** (3) schools have made arrangements to comply with the recommendations to secure independent, impartial guidance from a Level 6 specialist with a Matrix accredited provider.

· Approximately **10%** (4) either have internal staff qualified to Level 4 in Advice and Guidance or are in the process of training internal staff to L4.

· Approximately **27%** (10) have secured support from specialist advisers working as a sole trader (not Matrix accredited) who are either employed by the school or working on a self employed basis.

· The remaining **55%** (20) are still in the process of deciding what provision to make.

· Some of this 55% have declared that they will make no provision until they are forced into a stronger position to do so.

The position regarding the monitoring and sanctions for not fulfilling this duty has not been helpful in terms of encouraging schools to take this responsibility seriously. Other competing pressures have taken centre stage.

41. CfBT Education Trust

Whether a young person receives face to face guidance is now very much a post code lottery and whether they are fortunate enough to be attending a school which places high value on impartial, independent careers guidance. In addition many schools are offering less face to face guidance than was previously available under Connexions. In one area there is a 70% reduction in the amount of face to face guidance available. This is countered in another area where all but one school has purchased guidance services at the same level as they received under Connexions.

Currently local authorities are taking varying views on what their role should be. Some are continuing to provide a guidance service but only to vulnerable young people. Others are delivering their bare minimum i.e. completion of the Section 139a for young people with learning difficulties/disabilities. Even where local authorities are continuing to offer a careers guidance service it has been cut. In one area 15% but higher in others (50%).

42. Andrew J McGregor -a Practicing Careers Adviser.

By June 2012 the Connexions Centre I was based in had closed and the team of 10 Careers Advisers had been broken up. Of the 6 schools the team covered it was estimated that in September 2012 there would be around a half of what there was in terms of face to face provision. One notable Academy school was planning to provide no face to face guidance seeing it as "unnecessary."

43. Melanie Jameson + Christopher Rossiter – Dyslexia

We strongly urge the committee to ensure that all career advisers officers have at least a basic awareness of these issues (relating to Dyslexia) and know how to access further information. We are aware both of lower levels of employment amongst people with disabilities, and of significant under-employment

44. Bryan Summers

No statistical evidence submitted.

Students when asked prefer face to face Information, Advice and Guidance. Web sites offer Information and then you need an Adviser to help you make your decision. Students need to be helped and prepared to make their own decisions.

45. Warwick Institute for Employment Research

A decade ago, national research conducted on behalf of the Learning & Skills Council (2002) indicated that more than half (54%) [of parents questioned did not know what options are available to their children when they leave school, and 70% feared broaching the subject because their attempts to do so lead to arguments.

46. Department for Education

Ofsted carried out a thematic survey [2] of information, advice and guidance that identified inconsistencies in provision. A survey of young people also reported that 51% of young people feel that careers education, information, advice and guidance is not meeting their needs. (The Edge Foundation (2010), Learner's Survey)

Schools will be able to demonstrate the quality of their careers 'offer' to young people through working towards a 'quality award'. There are a number of such awards currently in operation, which the careers sector is currently working to bring together under a national validation, the 'Quality in Careers Standard', to ensure consistency of approach. There is no requirement for schools to hold a quality award, although research conducted by the Learning and Skills Improvement Service in 2010 [14] suggested that 50% of schools and 49% of colleges either held or were working towards an award under existing voluntary arrangements.

The proportion of 16-18 year olds in education and work based learning has risen by 1.4 percentage points from 80.8% in 2010 to 82.2% in 2011. However, employment rates at ages 16, 17 and 18 have fallen, resulting in an increase in the proportion of 16-18 year olds NEET by 0.6 percentage points from 7.5% in 2010 to 8.1% in 2011.

47. Ofsted

Ofsted's recent surveys found that when careers guidance was provided by the schools themselves, its quality varied. The three most critical factors in determining the quality of careers guidance were: the priority given to it within the school curriculum; the extent to which the staff providing it had enough knowledge or experience to do so effectively; and the impartiality and breadth of the advice. The introduction of national standards for this work had helped to raise its profile but, at the time of most of the visits (between 2008 and 2010), the surveys found no evidence of consequent improvement in the quality and consistency of the provision of careers services.

The Connexions service generally provided good support in the institutions visited. Nevertheless, particularly in the secondary schools visited, careers education was sometimes taught by those who did not have sufficient and up-to-date knowledge and, in some cases, the provision was perfunctory. The information, advice and

22nd January 2013

guidance given were not always sufficiently impartial about the options available to young people at the age of 16, for example where secondary schools had their own sixth forms. Schools that had made careers guidance a high cross-curriculum priority had good links with a wide range of employers and ensured that their work-related learning and work experience programme provided pupils with good opportunities to explore their possible career options. Effective activities included: experience or work tasters; workplace visits to allow direct observation of a professional at work; mentoring activities; and extended discussion with a professional about what their job was actually like.

In all of Ofsted's surveys, there was considerable variation in the quality of advice and guidance, and, in particular, a failure to meet the needs of some of the most potentially vulnerable young people.

Ofsted does not have the necessary evidence to address this question directly. However, there is evidence that shows where young people had work experience at school to help them decide on an apprenticeship, they were more likely to make good progress in that apprenticeship.

Young people who had experienced visits to work places, visits to schools by employers and careers events valued getting face-to-face advice from an employer. As stated, young people who had undertaken well-organised work experience, or some form of vocational taster courses while still at school, were more successful in making good progress with their apprenticeship framework than those starting straight from school without such experience.

48. Careers England

Increasing the number of decision-makers affecting access to CEIAG from the 152 Local Authorities to circa 4000 Head Teachers exacerbates, rather than diminishes, the likelihood of the post-code lottery which blighted previous provision according to Government statements justifying the change.

Research undertaken recently by the independent education foundation Edge, and widely reported in the education press, found that a third of students surveyed had not been presented with the option of taking up a vocational course and that 77% of A level students surveyed were discouraged from pursuing a vocational path. Almost 25% of these students reportedly thought their school was more concerned with sending students to university than concentrating on what is right for the individual.

Decisions need to be informed by the labour market – as confirmed by recent research [13] which identified the mismatch between training undertaken and vacancies available in the labour market, e.g. the environmental industry created an estimated 89,000 jobs last year, but only 27,000 young people were trained to take them, whilst applications to work in media were heavily over-subscribed.

[13] Centre for Social and Economic Inclusion (CESI) for the Local Government Association (LGA) – Hidden talents: Skills mismatch analysis, published June 2012

49. Centrepoint

In a recent survey of the young people that Centrepoint works with, only 41% of young people rated careers advice provide by schools or colleges as 'very good' or 'good'. This compares to 63% who rated Connexions services as 'good' or 'very good' and 77% who rated Centrepoint careers provision as 'good' or 'very good'. [1

Table 1: Connexions vs. school/college provided careers guidance

Service providing careers guidance	Those that found it 'poor' or 'very poor'	Those that found it 'good' or 'very good'
Connexions	2%	63%
School/college	34%	41%

Research from the NUS and the Learning and Skills Improvement Service found that: "when asked to indicate how they would prefer to receive help and support in the future, the majority of survey respondents (64%) stated face-to-face as their first preference. This is contrast with just 3 per cent who reported that their preferred mode of delivery was 'by telephone'... with one in six (16%) learners stating that they would prefer to access information [via the internet]". [1]

Table 2: current and proposed careers entitlements for young people

Age	Education status	Telephone? (National Careers Service: 0800 100 900)	Online? (https://nationalcareers.service.direct.gov.uk)	Face-to-face? (at e.g. Jobcentre, school or college)
14 – 16	In education or training	Yes	Yes	Maybe (if at a school which provides it)
	Not in education or training	Yes	Yes	No
17 - 18	In education or training	Yes	Yes	Maybe* (if at a college or other FEI which provides it)
	Not in education or training	Yes	Yes	Maybe* (if 18 and on out of work benefits)
19 - 24	In education or training	Yes	Yes	Maybe (only three sessions if on out of work benefits, or one session if not)
	Not in education or training	Yes	Yes	Maybe (only three sessions if on out of work benefits, or one session if not)

[1] Centrepoint, Opportunity lost? The experiences of homeless young people in accessing education, training and work , forthcoming.

[1] NUS and LSIS (2012) Complex need, complex choices , p . 48.

[1] Careers England (2011) Looking to the future , p . 4.

50. National Governors Association

The advantage of providing a fully funded careers service that provides targeted face-to-face guidance is that costs can be reduced elsewhere. In 2010, an Audit Commission Report highlighted the costs of 2008 NEET (16-18 year olds not in education, employment or training) cohort over their lifetime as being £13 billion with a further £22 billion in opportunity costs. [7]

22nd January 2013

Further to this, research has shown that although many students make their final decisions on post 16 education or training in year 11, many students are thinking about this earlier on in their school education. A study by Foskett and Hemsley-Brown (2001) [9] found that 42% began the process in year 10 with 5% beginning the process before age 13.

7] Audit Commission, 'Against the Odds: Re-engaging Young People in Education, Employment or Training,' July 2010, p4

[9] Foskett, N. & Hemsley-Brown, J. (2001). *Choosing Futures: Young people's decision-making in education, training and career markets*. London: Routledge Falmer

51. National Care Advisory Service.

The education training and employment outcomes of looked after children and care leavers are poorer than their peers, making it all the more important to ensure they get adequate careers guidance. In the latest available statistics at Key Stage 4, 13% per cent achieved the 5+ A*-C at GCSE or equivalent including English and mathematics compared with 12% cent in 2010 [5] ; a third of care leavers were not in education, training and employment (NEET) at 19, compared 14% of all young people. Only 390 care leavers (6%) were in higher education at 19 in 2011. This compares to 40% of all young people at age 19 at university in 2010. [6]

[6] NCAS (2011) *Statistical Briefing: Looked after children and care leavers 2011* <http://resources.leavingcare.org/uploads/e7186fad64003f1f923d30a80243e38f.pdf>

3.4.1 Earlier this year we conducted a survey of local authority leaving care services across England to see how funding cuts had impacted on their services. Of the 34 managers who responded to our survey a third (32%) had seen a cut in their budget since last year and only five (15%) saw an increase. Two thirds of the managers we surveyed were working with larger cohorts than last year. The largest impact budget cuts were having on services was higher case loads for workers (64%). As a consequence, 38% of managers reported that workers would be seeing young people less often and 32% that they would be working more reactively, dealing with crises rather than working proactively. There is a worry that, as workers become stretched, they will be less able to provide careers advice to young people in and leaving care, as part of the pathway planning process. Indeed our young people's steering group particularly questioned how leaving care services will be able to manage high case loads as well as offering careers advice.

3.4.2 In our survey, leaving care services reported that complementary local services and provision which they use to support care leavers were also significantly affected by cuts, especially careers support services that have played a key role in enhancing the support that is available to care leavers. 82% of respondents reported a reduction or closure of their Connexions services. On a more positive note, although 11 respondents reported a reduction in employability services, eight had seen these services enhanced.

52. Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations (OCR)

No statistical evidence submitted but the following summary statements :

It is important for the inquiry to recognise that careers guidance for individuals operates in a context of institutional competition. Where institutions have incentives to attract and retain students as, in effect, units of funding they have an obvious interest in presenting themselves in the most favourable light and others less so. They may also wish to screen out students whose prospects of achievement in a world of league tables are more uncertain than others.

22nd January 2013

Therefore the assurance of independence in guidance is an important component of the new requirement in Key Stage 4 and will remain so in any future extension to other ages. It will require an intensive period of monitoring by Ofsted if the new statutory requirement is to be met with an acceptable level of institutional consistency.

53. Society of Motor Manufacturers and Traders (SMMT)

No relevant statistics were submitted but the following statement as an extract of their evidence :

Careers advice should truly reflect the UK careers market, with a variety of qualification routes and opportunities available to young people with a range of ambitions and abilities. The influence a careers adviser can have on a young person and the UK workforce cannot be quantified but is undoubtedly significant. Good quality and well-informed careers advice from an early age (specifically before options are made for GCSE subjects) is therefore critical for young people, the education system and the wider economy.

54. ANSBURY

The extent of face-to-face guidance offered to young people

Across Bournemouth Dorset and Poole there are 39 mainstream secondary schools. Their approach to meeting their duty is as follows

Bournemouth - 10 mainstream schools/academies; 2 buying in and 1 other has expressed a wish to do so; 3/10 = 30%; Total 4.5 days per week of face to face guidance; Average days per week buy in across 3 schools = 1.5; 3 schools employed their own "in house" adviser with no other arrangements in place; 4 schools have no plans in place to meet the duty. Bournemouth Special schools are expecting an S139a service from the Local authority but have no plans in place to buy in other guidance.

Dorset - 20 mainstream schools/academies; 13 buying services; 13/20 = 65%; Total 19.5 days per week; Average days per week buy in across 13 schools = 1.5; 1 school has employed its own "in house" adviser/careers co-ordinator; 6 schools have no plans to meet the duty; All learning centres and special schools will receive a service from Ansbury through the LA Connexions contract.

Poole - 9 Mainstream schools/academies including a Learning Centre; 6 buying services from Ansbury; 1 Academy is buying services from a sole trader; 7/9 = 78%; Total 8.5 days per week (Ansbury); Average days per week buy in across 6 schools = 1.4(Ansbury); 1 school has an adviser employed by the school; 1 school has no plans to meet the duty. Students in the 5 Special schools will receive an S139a service from their home LA. 2 Special schools are buying a service from a sole trader; 2 others are employing an "in house" careers adviser; 1 very small special school may buy in a service as and when needed. Compared to 2009-2010 school year we estimate an overall reduction of at least 75% in the overall face-to-face guidance available to young people in schools in the Bournemouth, Dorset and Poole areas. Clearly this will vary between institutions.

At one time it if an LA had a not known figure greater than 5% national Government would want an explanation. Now looking at the July figures I see the national average is 11%. One regional average is 25% with some LA around, and in some cases over the 50% mark. Sadly no action is being taken to call these LAs to account. Therefore unemployed young people in these areas are clearly not receiving a service to help them to re-engage in Education and Training.

55. The Science Council

A recent survey of over 3,000 7-18 year olds by City and Guilds showed that 64% of 14-18 year olds had received careers IAG from their teacher. [11] However, the Times Education Supplement and Education and

22nd January 2013

Employers Taskforce have found that 53% of teachers and school leaders surveyed were not confident about providing advice on apprenticeships [12]

[12] <http://www.tes.co.uk/article.aspx?storycode=6260004>

56. UNISON

The absence of regulatory rigour and safeguards within the new legislation and the cuts the service has faced have led to a postcode lottery on the type and level of careers advice available to young people in schools and colleges. For example, in Birmingham, which is within the top 20 youth unemployment hotspots, the budget has been reduced from £11m to £3.8m since 2010. This has led to a loss of two-thirds of the staff and in the second largest city in the UK there is now only one advice centre open.

Research published in July 2011 [1] revealed that of 144 local authorities only 15 would maintain what the researchers termed as a "substantial service". In six London boroughs - Kingston, Merton, Sutton, Richmond, Croydon and Bromley - all the Connexions careers service offices have been closed. In Hull the number of careers advisers has been reduced from 81 to 18. In other authorities careers staff have been merged into generic youth work posts.

[1] 1 The Careers Service Collapse or Transition August 2011
http://www.derby.ac.uk/files/careers_transition_paper.pdf

57. The National Foundation for Education Research

A review of careers professionals' involvement with schools in the UK was conducted as part of *From Education to Employment*, a strand of NFER's Research Programme. It showed that there are three main ingredients of high-quality careers education and guidance: collaborative working; personalised support; and appropriate programmes. Evidence from a number of studies highlighted in the review suggest that good collaborative working between schools and outside agencies (such as employers or careers advisors) is fundamental. Additionally, collaborative approaches are particularly effective with 'at risk' young people because they enable schools to draw on different kinds of support to tackle specific needs, and so provide tailored guidance and personalised support. This is essential to responding to the complex needs of different groups and individuals (see paragraph 7.1 and 7.2 below). The evidence suggests that successful CE/IAG programmes are those that are well structured, integrated into the curriculum, and supported at a strategic level by senior management teams. They are most effective when appropriately timed, providing support at the earliest opportunity and at key transition points. It is a combination of these approaches, together with high-quality, impartial and relevant programmes, as well as advice from parents and families, that works best in supporting young people's decision-making. Where these elements are in place, it is likely that destination data will reveal lower dropout rates at 17 and positive transitions to education, employment and training post-compulsory participation age (<http://www.nfer.ac.uk/publications/RCPI01>).

58. Institute of Careers Guidance (ICG)

In one Local Authority area, from a survey of 100 schools, 50% were commissioning independent career guidance services from the existing provider, with a further 10-15% bringing in other providers, and the remainder appearing to have decided to take careers guidance in-house. Those commissioning independent career guidance are purchasing between 6 and 45 days of services, ranging from token provision to genuine attempts to meet student needs.

22nd January 2013

One large area reported that school provision was only skimming the surface and conducted by unqualified careers staff. On the plus side, in the area where 50% of schools have commissioned some provision from the existing provider, it appears that the time purchased is largely for face-face career guidance.

In two examples where the Local Authority is offering a minimum service face-to-face guidance is only offered where young people in years 9-11 fall into the identified target group.

What is clear, however, is that in many schools in the sample, after years spent developing an approach to meeting the career guidance needs of students at a time at which the individual most needs it, face-to-face careers guidance has largely reverted to a standard Year 11 intervention, in the form of a careers interview.

In other examples, ICG members report that there is no time available for face-to face guidance.

59. Professor Tony Watts OBE

The process of erosion begun under the Labour Governments of 1997-2010

whereas previously most young people had received at least one personal careers interview, by 2008 only 40% received an interview with a personal adviser, who might or might not be a professional careers adviser. [3] It also resulted in a significant reduction in funding for such provision: at 2010 rates, from £303m in 2000/01 to £196m in 2010/11. [4]

[3] Watts, A.G. (2008). *The partnership model for careers education and guidance in schools and colleges: rise, decline – and fall? Career Research and Development*, 20, 4-8.

[4] Watts, A.G. (2012). *The Coalition's Emerging Policies on Career Guidance. Careers England Policy Commentary 15B. See pp.33-34.*

.....it is worth noting that the future of work experience at 14-16 is currently threatened by the attack on it in the Wolf Report [8] , by the removal of funding for Education Business Partnerships (EBPs), and by the Government's decision to remove the duty to deliver work-related learning at Key Stage 4 despite the fact that 89% of consultation respondents favoured its retention [9] and despite the clear research evidence on the benefits of pre-16 work experience [10] .

[10] Mann, A. (2012). *Work Experience: Impact and Delivery – Insights from the Evidence. London: Education and Employers Taskforce.*

60. Newcastle County Council Children's Services

No statistics provided but the following example of working practice quoted :

The NCC model of delivery has the Connexions Service delivering the statutory services to targeted students in a variety of settings. Additional services that schools can buy is called the 'Careers PA+' Service. These services can be purchased as a package or on an individual, hourly basis....

Purchasing the 'Careers PA+' service also ensures that schools are able to continue to access free training and professional updating from Connexions Tyne and Wear HUB Services. The best provision incorporates use of qualified impartial Connexions staff alongside the school's own trained, qualified personnel in delivering a whole-school approach to Careers Education, Information Advice and Guidance. This type of provision also engages expertise from local Colleges, Universities, Work-Based Learning Providers and businesses and includes work with staff, students and parents within the wider Careers Education curriculum.

22nd January 2013

It is recognised nationally that impartiality can be an issue in schools with 6th forms as highlighted by the Association of Colleges's survey, March 2012.

61. Institute of Mathematics and its Applications

The following statements were submitted as part of the evidence provided:

We believe that the careers advice for mathematics should begin in the classroom with the applications of mathematics being shown in conjunction with the core mathematics which is being taught.

We are concerned that individual schools will struggle to resource careers services sufficiently to promote mathematics in a way which its sustained contribution to society and the economic health of the country requires, and that the social acceptability of being 'poor' at mathematics will remain unchallenged.

The experience of the IMA is that a successful careers guidance service requires a wealth of expertise which, we believe, schools will struggle to provide.

62. Think Global and the British Council

The vast majority of businesses think it is important for schools to be helping young people to think more globally and lead more sustainable lives, and four-fifths think schools should be doing more: 93% of businesses think it is important for schools to help young people develop the ability to think globally. 80% think schools should be doing more; only 2% think they should be doing less.

63. Association of Employment and Learning Providers. (AELP)

The following is an extract from the Executive Summary:

Access to guidance about all the options and the progression routes that these open up, is vital. All young people need face to face careers guidance (and not just be pointed to a website or given a phone number to call).

Schools must not be allowed simply to make arrangements for careers guidance that they feel meets the needs of their pupils and only be expected to work as appropriate with external and expert providers. Firm and decisive action needs to be taken to ensure that they fully understand and meet their statutory duties

Information, advice and guidance must not be just impartial and independent but must provide comprehensive information about all options – ideally presenting a range of **common** information/ data /facts

There should be greater involvement of employers, both to input information on local labour market needs and ensure understanding of the need for basic employability skills.

Ofsted should look at the delivery of information, advice and guidance as part of school inspection.

What is needed is a more detailed set of measurable careers guidance duties, backed up by specific underpinning statutory guidance and a rigorous Ofsted inspection regime. This would go a long way to ensure that all young people receive the best possible independent IAG, enabling them to make genuine informed choices about their education, training and future career prospects.

22nd January 2013

64. Association for Careers Education and Guidance (ACEG)

The following is an extract from the executive summary:

Since the Act states that careers education and work-related learning are no longer statutory, some schools are intending to withdraw both from the curriculum, opting instead to provide them on an ad-hoc basis via well-meaning teachers or tutors. However, unless these teachers/tutors receive specialist training in maintaining impartiality and are regularly updated with information about all courses, employment or training opportunities available to their pupils, they will be unable to meet the demand This responsibility CANNOT effectively be carried out solely by a commissioned careers guidance practitioner.

This careers guidance element of the 2011 Education Bill falls way short of improving young people's access to - or quality of - careers education and guidance, resulting in no standardised national entitlement for young people to careers guidance at a time of soaring youth unemployment – a travesty for this generation of young people. To make matters worse, the nature of 'vulnerability' varies across local authorities resulting in disparity of opinion about to whom the local authority will provide careers guidance. We recommend policy on careers guidance provision is revised so that people of all ages, abilities and needs have equal access to impartial careers guidance from a professionally-qualified National Careers Service adviser.

65. Association of South East Colleges (AOSEC)

College Careers Advisers are often professionally qualified and have undertaken impartiality training. They provide advice to students as well as external applicants. However, Colleges have reported a shortage of Careers Advisers following the demise of Connexions and other careers support services.

Colleges have often found that it is difficult to receive an invitation to talk to students in their local schools about the post-16 options that they offer, particularly where schools have their own sixth forms, because the schools see the College as being in competition

From September 2012, when the duty to secure independent impartial career guidance for pupils transfers from local authorities to schools, there are two issues that need to be addressed. Firstly, whilst statutory guidance will be available to schools on careers advice for young people, the interpretation of this will depend on the Head teacher, which may result in quite a variety of different advice being offered. Secondly, the duty states that the guidance should be provided by someone "external" to the school, in order to classify as "independent", and this could lead to the post-16 options at the local College being omitted.

All young people, not just the more disadvantaged, should be able to access face-to-face careers guidance and it is important that the National Careers Service provides this facility.

More high quality, impartial, careers advice for young people about their academic and vocational options, particularly around the apprenticeship route, will be key to helping the Government achieve its target of full participation for young people aged 17 from 2013 and 18 from 2015.

66. Gatsby Charitable Foundation

The following statements have been extracted from the evidence submitted:

Successive governments have failed to create a system that gives all young people access to high-quality career guidance.

22nd January 2013

Career guidance is one of the most frequently reformed parts of the education system. Every incoming government over the last 20 years has denounced the career guidance system they inherited, and hastily implemented an extensive programme of reform, often at significant cost.

.As yet, none of these reforms have created a system that provides consistently good career guidance to all young people. And early indications are that the current Government's policies will be no different; the quality of career guidance in schools is likely to remain highly variable under the new arrangements.

Recommendation: We are concerned that the Government's decision to devolve responsibility for career guidance to schools has not been accompanied by a strong framework of quality assurance and a statutory duty against which schools can be held to account. We recommend that Government gives Ofsted a greater and clearer remit in respect of career guidance in schools.

67. Greater Merseyside Connexions (GMCP)

GMCP has worked diligently with its local schools and as a consequence of direct engagement with Headteachers has secured the purchase of careers advice services from approximately 75% of schools based on an individualised portfolio of professional services for each school; however a number of schools who are commissioning services are buying less service than they had previously enjoyed due to the lack of funding available to support their needs. Where schools are not purchasing from GMCP they are either buying from sole traders, often Connexions Personal Advisers who have been made redundant as a consequence of the funding cuts, or are not making any impartial careers advice provision at all.

The provision of impartial advice by schools is a perennial problem. GMCP Careers Advisers have raised particular concerns over post 16 options over many years. A number of schools with sixth forms do not provide IAG on post 16 options other than for their own courses and are resistant to display college information, preventing students from attending local college open days and refusing requests from colleges to attend open evenings. The Association of Colleges has recently carried out research to evidence this claim. Members considered that the quality of advice given at schools without sixth forms was 'poor' in 14% of cases, but 51% thought that the advice available in schools with sixth forms was 'poor,' 'limited' or 'non-existent'.

.....with the reduction in funding outcomes for targeted groups of vulnerable young people outcomes have decreased since 2010. Outcomes are worse than for their peers and are worsening. In LCR the rate of participation in education, employment or training has dropped against a profile of 92% participation for the wider cohort, for example:

Care leavers from 61% to 47% ; Young offenders from 54% to 37%; Young people with special educational needs from 83% to 65%

68. Adviza

Huge difference in range of provision planned by schools means IAG experienced by students will be unequal and varied with some receiving relatively little input. For many young people the quality and amount of guidance received will be dependent on which school's catchment area they live in. e.g. compare 2 Oxfordshire Schools.

School A has a year 11 cohort of approximately 115 and no 6th form. This school is buying 35 days of Careers Adviser time for the year commencing September 2012.

·School B has a year 11 cohort of approximately 265 and a 6th form of 357. This school is buying 30 days Careers Adviser time.

22nd January 2013

Many schools do not understand/accept the need for impartiality. Across Oxfordshire several schools (approximately 15%) are directly employing their own Careers Adviser to deliver "impartial" IAG. These schools do not intend to supply any face to face IAG from an independent source. Some of these schools have directly employed qualified careers advisers but have no plans or structure in place to supply these advisers with training and continuous professional development opportunities and have no facility for providing the required support and supervision. It is therefore likely that over a period of time not only will these schools not be providing genuine impartial guidance but it will also be guidance that is not based on current information and good practice.

69. The Russell Group

We are very concerned that in some schools students are not getting the right advice and guidance on the subjects to study, meaning that many good students have not even done the courses they need to apply to the most competitive degree programmes and universities. For example, in 2011, despite accounting for only 14.3% of A-level entries overall, the independent school sector accounted for nearly a fifth of all entries for A-level Mathematics, a subject that is commonly required for entry to a wide range of degrees at our universities [4].

[4] Source: DfE: GCE /Applied GCE A/AS and equivalent examination results in England, 2010/11 (provisional) . Available from <http://www.education.gov.uk/rsgateway/DB/SFR/s001035/sfr27-2011v3.pdf>

Degree subject choice also matters. Young people with less familiarity with or family history of higher education need help to understand the full range of opportunities available and subjects on offer at university. For example, at Oxford state school pupils apply disproportionately for the most oversubscribed subjects, with 36% of all state school applicants between 2009 and 2011 on average applying for the five most over-subscribed subjects [8].

[8] University of Oxford Undergraduate Admissions Statistics: 2011 entry. See http://www.ox.ac.uk/about_the_university/facts_and_figures/undergraduate_admissions_statistics/school_type.html

70. Wellcome Trust

It is vital that all information and advice is of the highest quality, whether it is independent advice sought by schools from the National Careers Service or from the 'Labour Market Information for All' project. We hope that the Matrix standard noted by the DfE will ensure high standards.

Now that schools will not have a dedicated budget for the provision of careers advice and guidance, they may struggle to prioritise the delivery of high quality services especially if school budgets are tight. It will be important to maintain the emphasis placed on delivering high quality careers advice and guidance for young people. Accountability through the school governance framework should hold the school to account for the progression of their students and ensure that young people are receiving the services they need.

71. Association of Schools and College Leaders

Individual face-to-face careers guidance has been the norm in secondary schools and colleges for many years. A survey of 1000 ASCL members in autumn 2011, though not exhaustive, indicated that 42% were still making face-to-face guidance from a qualified professional available to any students in need of it. However in the same survey 30% were 'extremely concerned about their capacity to meet the new requirements'.

72. Careers South West

Many schools are still making commissioning decisions (or deciding not to commission) at the time of writing at the end of the summer term. Local evidence seems to indicate the full range of responses from doing nothing to maintain services at or near previous standards. This is consistent with the national picture reported in the **Times Educational Supplement on 6th July 2012**. In this article it was reported that:

- almost half of teachers believed the quality and quantity of careers advice will deteriorate when the responsibility is passed to schools;

- 53% of teachers do not feel confident giving advice about apprenticeships;

- 62% of school leaders said they still have no firm plans in place; and

- many schools are planning to cut back on work experience at the same time as they take on their new responsibilities.

In the area covered by Careers South West (at the time known as Connexions Cornwall and Devon) we continued to find it possible to maintain this level of face-to-face contact within the budgets provided until the major cuts to the Area Based Grant in 2010. We continue to be one of the better funded areas for careers work in schools. However the local authority funding has reduced year on year with 2011/12 enabling us to achieve around 50% face-to-face contact and in 2012/13 the local authority funded work in schools has reduced face-to-face contact to around 25%, being with the most vulnerable and focused on those likely to disengage from learning rather than to assist students in making high quality informed choices between further learning or work options. Around 25% of schools chose to buy in additional services in 2011/12 to enable face-to-face delivery to between 50 – 85% of their cohorts. The picture for buy in of time from schools in 2012/13 is higher, but when the loss of local authority funded provision is taken into account appears to indicate a significant deterioration in the levels of access to face-to-face careers guidance when compared with previous years, with the most able students being hardest hit. Under schools' commissioning we appear to have lost any consistency of provision and sense of entitlement.

On the **24th May 2012 Young People Now** reported that:

"The proportion of 16-to 18-year-olds that have fallen off the radar after leaving compulsory education has risen to more than ten per cent in a quarter of local authorities..."

And that:

"According to Department for Education figures, the number of young people categorised as "not known" has now exceeded one in ten in 38 local authorities."

It is therefore unsurprising that in the same article it was reported that:

"...the latest government statistics show the number of 16-to 18-year-olds not in employment, education or training (NEET) increased from 159,000 in the first quarter of 2011 to 183,000 in the same period this year".

73. David Andrews OBE

No statistical data or evidence was produced but the following statements were made :

22nd January 2013

The emerging national picture is one of wide variety of approaches, between areas and within individual local authorities. Some young people will continue to have access to good quality support, either through their families or because their schools are committed to making such support available. Others will be able to take advantage of the targeted support from the local authority because they fall into certain priority categories. However, too many young people will not have access to the careers guidance support they need in the current climate.

The Government needs to decide between constituting and funding the new National Careers Service as a proper all-age careers guidance service, offering face-to-face guidance for young people as well as for adults, or establishing a robust school-based model with support from the National Careers Service. The potential foundations for either model are already in place: both, however, would require significant shifts from current policy.

74. British Youth Council

Young people say they are most influenced by parents, websites, teachers and friends, and over 80 per cent of respondents who had received formal careers advice found it to be 'a little bit' or 'not at all' helpful. Perceptions about the helpfulness of formal careers advice did not vary significantly according to where it was delivered, suggesting that the setting may be less important than the way in which the advice is formulated and delivered.

Here at the British Youth Council an online survey of around 500 young people, aged 12-26 years, was carried out to ascertain their views and experiences of careers advice. Of all of the respondents who had received careers advice, 80% found it to be 'a little bit' or 'not at all' helpful. Respondents who had received careers guidance noted such things as; 'The whole system was overly simplified, unrealistic and to be honest a little patronising' and 'Absolutely useless, very little knowledge of what is out there and even less about practical steps needed to get there'. It is with this view point that we would start by saying that one of our biggest concerns would be the quality of career guidance on offer, and not necessarily the age at which it becomes mandatorily available.

Who Delivers the Guidance? ...

job and careers websites are nudging into second place behind parents but before teachers (65.3% and 58.2% respectively), with 60.8 per cent of young people saying they use these for information more than they use other family members, adverts, newspapers and magazines or TV. In fact, adverts seem to have a marginal influence, with only 19.9 per cent of young people being influenced by them. Nearly a third (30.2 per cent) of young people were influenced by multiple sources.

The use of websites appears to increase with age, perhaps because teachers are no longer available, and any authority parents had in this area has been 'used up'. So while 54.5 per cent of 14-21-year-olds get their information from the web, this rises to almost 70 per cent of 22-26-year-olds. Web-based information is now a key route for young people and more should perhaps be being made of it, taking into account the fact that access may typically be unsupervised.

When asked which was the single most influential source of information, the pattern of the top four remains the same: parents (26.9 per cent), followed by websites (22.6 per cent), teachers (20 per cent) and friends (10.8 per cent). The value of using adverts as a source of information about jobs and careers drops to being the least influential, with only 1.9 per cent of respondents finding them the most useful, followed by other relatives (2.8 per cent), siblings (3.4 per cent) and TV (4.7 per cent).

22nd January 2013

75. City of Bradford MDC

No relevant statistical evidence but they have stated an example of interesting practise:

After a competitive tender process, led by the LA and with representative provider partners on the project group, we have appointed Prospects Ltd as our provider. They have been our Connexions provider for the past two years and have consistently provided a high quality service.

Each signed-up provider is committed to a minimum payment of £10,000 for the academic year 2012-13, for which they receive 1.5 days of Personal Adviser (PA) time, which can be used flexibly by schools to support them in meeting the needs of their students. Schools and colleges can buy additional time if they wish to.

We will retain the Connexions brand, as this is known and trusted in Bradford, We are pleased that we have been able to provide schools and colleges with good value for money at a time when they must pay for a service they previously received free. Schools and colleges have been happy that we have removed the burden of procurement from them; they have trusted the LA to undertake this work on their behalf, and they have confidence in the company who will provide the service. The local authority will be monitoring contract delivery on behalf of schools and colleges.

The following recommendations were made :

Put in place a properly funded, impartial face-to-face careers information, advice and guidance service that assists young people into the most appropriate provision for learning pathways to employment. This would be best organised through local authorities working in partnership with local providers.

Re-introduce the requirement for schools to include Careers Education and Guidance in the curriculum. It should be a stated, compulsory part of the secondary curriculum and an entitlement for all young people.

76. National Union of Teachers (NUT)

The NUT believes that the new duty to be introduced in September 2012 which places schools under an obligation to secure access to independent and impartial career guidance for pupils in years 9-11 will be problematic.

A survey carried out by the TES and the Education and Employers Task Force charity (July 2012) found, for example, that nearly 53 per cent of teachers did not feel confident about giving advice about apprenticeships. The survey of almost a thousand teachers and school leaders revealed major uncertainty in schools about the changes to careers information, advice and guidance.

77. Barry Jackson, Company Director, BWJ Enterprise Trading as Aspire Academy

The following statements have been extracted from the anecdotal evidence submitted :

Impartial advice is to be made a statutory requirement. So it should be; but if this is the objective, why are schools receiving £6,000 for every 6th form place they fill? With such a huge incentive for schools to encourage students to stay on after G.C.S.E.'s, is it surprising that students are encouraged to believe that this is the only route to success. Is it surprising that so little encouragement to explore the apprenticeship route occurs when there is such a massive disincentive for schools to do so. Expecting impartiality is both unreasonable and certainly unrealistic until this issue is addressed. Not only will schools not provide impartial advice in house, many will even deny students access to outsiders who offer it.

22nd January 2013

.....schools are never going to see the provision of career guidance as anything more than an interruption to Core Curriculum teaching, especially when schools as a whole, and individual teachers, are assessed solely on the basis of exam results and positions in league tables.

78. Confederation of British Industry (CBI)

Careers advice and guidance has not been delivering results and this is a long standing issue, not just for the current system. Responding to the CBI/Pearson Education and Skills Survey 2012 [1], improved careers advice and guidance was employers' top priority for 14-19 education. For example, only 4% of responding employers told us that careers advice is currently good enough. The majority of employers (72%) told us that careers advice and guidance must improve. CBI data [2] has identified several key weaknesses with careers advice and guidance as it has been delivered under recent systems. They include advice that that is:

·irrelevant and/or not timely; fails to inspire general careers awareness ; inaccurate or not grounded in the labour market; and an absence of advice about vocational options

Employers can help tackle these problems by working with schools to meet their self-identified needs. For example, ensuring that careers advisers have information that is grounded in the labour market means that advice is always up to date and relevant to young people. Many employers (51% of those with links to schools provide careers advice / talks [3]) also work with schools, either directly or through national schemes, to inspire young people about career paths or choices.

Careers advice and guidance must sit within a framework for improving the school-work transition as a whole

Recognising the important role they have to play, many employers already play a role in the delivery of careers advice and guidance, working with schools to help meet their self-identified needs. According to the CBI/Pearson Education and Skills Survey 2012, over half (51%) of those with links to schools contribute in this way. Around 40% of involvement is via individual links with businesses and schools, and around 15% engage via national programmes such as STEM ambassadors or *Prospects*.

All of this requires strengthening relationships to business. Employers are willing to take this step, for example over half of respondents to our survey who are already involved in delivering careers advice in schools (60%) are willing to play a greater role.

79. National Children's Bureau

Evidence: results of an NCB/British Youth Council careers survey

In 2009, NCB in conjunction with the British Youth Council surveyed 500 young people about available sources of careers advice and what influences their choice of career. Young people said that they were most influenced by parents (65%), teachers (58%), friends (60%) and websites (60%). Over 80% of respondents who had received formal careers advice found it to be 'a little bit' or 'not at all' helpful and over a quarter (27%) had not used careers services.

80 London Councils

The purpose, nature, quality and impartiality of careers guidance provided by schools and colleges, and their preparedness to fulfil their new duty and the delivery of face to face guidance. In order for students to make informed choices about their future options and careers, they must receive accurate and impartial information, advice and guidance (IAG). In London, progression from Key Stage 4 into full time learning (88%)

22nd January 2013

exceeds national figures (87%), with 84% 16 to 18 year olds in learning (80% nationally) and 6% (5%) NEET. [1]
This indicates that IAG has been delivered well in the recent past.

In London from 2005 to 2010 effective guidance and tracking reduced NEET levels from 12% to 6%; central London boroughs reduced NEET levels by 39.3 per cent from 2004 to 2007 [5].

81 CIPD

In our recent *Learning to Work* survey we asked employers if they thought the young people they had recruited over the past year had inadequate career guidance and over half (53%) agreed. Furthermore, 63% said that the young people they had recruited lacked insight into the working world.

82. Pearson Think Tank and the International Centre for Guidance Studies

Our initial polling in Spring revealed widespread concerns about careers services amongst educators. Nearly two-thirds of educators (63%, 466) worry 'sometimes' or 'a lot' about the careers services available to school-aged children. Only a tiny minority (6%, 42) were not worried at all

83. Bradford and Keighley Youth Parliament.

Mainly anecdotal evidence submitted based upon some young peoples experience :

Current experiences of careers advice – what came across was that this currently varies according to school.

84. FutureYou

FutureYou welcomes the opportunity to respond to the Education Select Committee Consultation on Careers Guidance for Young People. Although FutureYou welcomes the new statutory duty on schools to secure access to independent and impartial careers guidance for their pupils in years 9 to 11 from September 2012 we are concerned that many schools lack the capacity and knowledge to provide robust, up-to-date careers advice, which means that many young people will be receiving patchy, poor quality advice and guidance which can affect their future prospects. This view is evidenced by the recent Association of Colleges (AoC) research which found that more than 80% of school teachers say that they have insufficient knowledge to provide careers advice. [2]

FutureYou conducted a retrospective online survey assessment of 1,166 young people aged 14 to 25 working with FY. The results indicate that young people rate the support they received highly. Nearly two thirds (61.0%) agreed with the statement "FutureYou has offered better information, advice and guidance than I got at school", half (49.9%) said "FutureYou has offered better information, advice and guidance than I got at college or university", and nearly two-thirds (60.6%) said "FutureYou has offered better information, advice and guidance than I got at the Job Centre". Added to this, where relevant, 46.4% said they got better careers advice or guidance from FutureYou than on the Work Programme, half (54.2%) said it was better than Connexions and over half (58.0%) said that the advice and guidance provided by FutureYou was better than that of other websites.

In a study by the UK Commission for Employment and Skills [3], only two-thirds (66%) of employers were satisfied with the work-preparedness of school leavers, 74% for college leavers and still only 84% for university graduates. According to a 2010 survey by the Confederation for British Industry [4], 57% of employers were unsatisfied with young employees' management of their personal responsibilities in areas such as timekeeping, while concerns about their teamwork skills, problem-solving abilities and attitudes to work were each cited by over a third. These concerns are mirrored by young people themselves: research conducted by

22nd January 2013

the Young Foundation with 13 – 19-year-olds found that only just over half (51%) believed that their school experience had prepared, or was preparing, them adequately for working life.

85. Fiona Hilton, Trafford Council

The following statement was submitted:

As the committee will be aware there is no longer a requirement for schools to deliver careers education programmes which would have been the mechanism to enable employers and learning providers to work with schools. The funding for Education Business Partnerships has also stopped which again is providing an additional financial strain on schools to pay for activities such as industry days. Local authorities feel that careers education is essential to make sure that young people are well informed of all options and this then means that the 1:1 guidance interview is far more effective. The statutory guidance for schools should include a requirement for schools to deliver a programme of careers education and this should be assessed against one of the national Careers Quality Standards kite marked quality awards.

.....

DMH Associates was established in August 2008. It aims to facilitate and provide high quality expertise on:

‘Careers policy, research and practice-based solutions that inform and influence investment in services to make a positive difference to people’s lives’.

DMH Associates operates within a framework designed to strengthen the inter-connectivity between policy, research and practice. Its body of research, evaluation, training and consultancy activities include:

- drawing upon clients/customers and deliverers’ experiences and perspectives;
- reviewing the implementation and effectiveness of local, regional, national, European and international guidance policies and practices;
- assessing and measuring the impact of youth, adult guidance and workforce development policies; and
- connecting policies to help achieve improved efficiencies within and across public, private and voluntary sector organisations.

<p>Dr Deirdre Hughes, OBE, PhD, M.A, Dip. C.G. Director, DMH Associates & Warwick Institute for Employment Research (IER) Associate Fellow</p>
--

Experience

Deirdre was awarded an Order of the British Empire (OBE) for her services to careers guidance in the 2012 New Year Honours List. She is a UK Commissioner and Chair of the National Careers Council in England. She is also a Lead Consultant on ‘Quality and Evidence’ in the European Lifelong Guidance Policy Network (ELGPN), an Associate Fellow at the Institute for Employment Research (IER), Warwick University, Past President and Fellow of the UK Institute of Career Guidance (ICG) and an Associate at the Centre for Educational Sociology, Edinburgh University. She works closely with leading UK, European and international academics in the field of careers policy, research and practice.

For more detailed information on her published research:

<http://www2.warwick.ac.uk/fac/soc/ier/people/assocfellows/>

<http://deirdrehughes.org/about-me/>